Godden Mackay Logan Heritage Consultants

Godden Mackay Logan is a leading provider of specialist advisory and research services in environmental heritage, planning and archaeology.

Godden Mackay Logan Pty Ltd (ACN 001 179 362) 78 George Street Redfern Sydney Australia 2016. Ph +61 2 9319 4811



Wahroonga (North) Heritage Conservation Area Review Final Report

Report prepared for Hornsby Shire Council July 2005

Report Register

The following report register documents the development and issue of the report entitled Wahroonga (North)—Heritage Conservation Area Review, undertaken by Godden Mackay Logan Pty Ltd in accordance with its quality management system. Godden Mackay Logan operates under a quality management system which has been certified as complying with the Australian/New Zealand Standard for quality management systems AS/NZS ISO 9001:2000.

Job No./Ref	Issue No.	Notes/Description	Issue Date
04-0065	1	Draft Report	March 2005
04-0065	2	Second Draft Report	May 2005
04-0065	3	Final Report	July 2005

	Contents Pa	ge
1.0 Ir	troduction	1
1.1	Background	1
	Community Consultation	
1.3	Study Area	2
1.4	Objectives	2
1.5	Study Team	2
1.6	Terminology	2
1.7	Acknowledgements	3
2.0 H	istorical Development	5
	Pre-European Occupation	
	Early European Occupation	
	The Railway	
	Notable Early Houses—The Highlands	
	Subdivision of the Estates	
	Housing Development During the Interwar and Post-war Period	
	Analysis of the Subdivision Patterns	
	The Sydney–Newcastle Freeway Construction	
	Endnotes	
	haracter	
	Description of the Study Area	
	Development Layout	
	Streetscape and Building Stock	
	eritage Values	
	-	
	Principles	
	Why the Wahroonga (North) Area is Significant Heritage Significance Assessment	
	Comparative Assessment	
	Summary Evaluation of Significance	
	Significant Characteristics of the Wahroonga (North) Conservation Area	
	Statement of Significance	
	eritage Items	
	Existing Heritage Items	
	Contributory Items	
	lanagement Policies, Development Guidelines and Controls	
	Introduction	
	General Management Policy	
E	S.2.1 Objectives	43
	Management Processes	
6.4	Development Guidelines and Controls	44
	6.4.1 Streetscape	
E	6.4.2 Existing Buildings (Alterations and Additions)	45
E	6.4.3 New Building or Replacement Development	46
E	6.4.4 Appropriate Housing and Development Forms	48
E	6.4.5 Garages, Carports and Outbuildings	49

6.4.6 Deta	ils and Materials	50
6.4.7 Fend	ces and Garden Walls	51
6.4.8 Gard	lens	52
6.4.9 Publ	lic Domain	53
7.0 Opportunitie	s and Threats	55
	ion	
7.2 Opportur	nities	55
7.2.1 Horn	nsby Shire Council Heritage Officer: Good Advice	55
7.2.2 Horn	nsby Shire Council Local Heritage Assistance Fund: Financial Support	55
7.2.3 Stroi	ng Community Support for Heritage	55
7.3 Threats.		56
7.3.1 State	e Environmental Planning Policy—Seniors Living 2004 Development	56
7.3.2 New	Oversized Faux-Heritage Development	56
7.3.3 Subo	division of Large Allotments	56
8.0 Planning Pol	licy Review	57
8.1 Hornsby	Shire Local Environmental Plan 1994	57
8.2 Hornsby	Shire Heritage Development Control Plan	58
8.3 Hornsby	Shire Dwelling House Development Control Plan	59
8.4 State En	vironmental Planning Policy—Seniors Living 2004	60
9.0 Recommend	ations	63
9.1 Adopt W	ahroonga (North) Heritage Conservation Area as a Conservation Area in the LEP	63
•	eritage Council Infill Guidelines	
9.3 Interpret	the Significance of the Heritage Conservation Area	63
9.4 Changes	to the Heritage DCP	64
9.5 Review of	of Existing Heritage Items	64
10.0 Appendices	\$	65
Appendix A	Godden Mackay Logan PowerPoint Presentation for Community Consultation, 2 December 2004	
Appendix B	Hornsby Shire Council PowerPoint Presentation for Community Consultation, 2 December 2004	
Appendix C	Summary Outcomes of the Community Consultation, 2 December 2004	
Appendix D	Wahroonga (North) Heritage Conservation Area Assessment, December 2004— Comments and Feedback Form	
Appendix E	Godden Mackay Logan PowerPoint Presentation for Community Consultation, 12 April 2005	
Appendix F	Summary Outcomes of the Community Consultation, 12 April 2005	

Introduction

1.1 Background

1.0

Godden Mackay Logan has been engaged by Hornsby Shire Council to assess the heritage and streetscape qualities of the Wahroonga (North) study area. As part of the assessment, a brief overview history of the settlement and development of the area was undertaken which included specific reference to early maps and subdivision plans, and incorporated detailed information from a substantial body of published and unpublished material. Using this as a guide, the study area has been assessed and reviewed, its heritage significance and character described, and the buildings and places that make a contribution to that significance have been identified and mapped.

Early subdivision maps and plans used in this report were obtained from Hornsby Library with assistance from the Local History Librarian, Neil Chippendale.

A survey of each property was undertaken by the Godden Mackay Logan team on foot between October and November 2004. Each property was assessed from the street for its contribution to the significance of the area. The fieldwork determined the heritage values and significant characteristics of the area, reviewing the physical evidence of the area's history. The field survey in turn informed further historic research, including close analysis of the potential boundary and adjacent areas.

A Summary Statement of Significance was then prepared for the area, together with a summary of the characteristics that contribute to its significance.

1.2 Community Consultation

In December 2004, Godden Mackay Logan, in conjunction with Hornsby Shire Council, conducted a community consultation meeting to present the preliminary findings of the study. Residents of the potential Conservation Area were invited to hear the background to the study, and comment on the process. Approximately forty residents attended the meeting. The PowerPoint presentations presented to the meeting are reproduced as Appendix A (Godden Mackay Logan) and Appendix B (Hornsby Council). These were also made available to residents who had been unable to attend. The outcomes of the meeting are summarised in Appendix C and were, in summary:

- local interest in the area and support for the possibility of the declaration of a Heritage Conservation Area (HCA);
- local interest in the effect a HCA would have on their property; and
- local interest in the effect a HCA would have on the area, particularly in regards to density and new development.

Following submission of the draft report to Council, a second community consultation session was held in April 2005 to discuss the draft report outcomes and recommendations, at which, again,

approximately forty residents were present, not all of which had attended the December meeting. The PowerPoint presentation for this meeting is presented as Appendix E.

1.3 Study Area

The study area is bounded by Edgeworth David Ave in the north, Myra Street in the west, Alexandria Parade in the south and the Newcastle–Sydney freeway in the east. This area is illustrated in Figure 1.1.

1.4 Objectives

The objectives for the study were to:

- research the history of the area using sub-division plans, existing histories, other documents and stakeholder consultation;
- investigate and identify elements with heritage significance within the study area;
- formulate a detailed character statement and Statement of Significance for the study area;
- identify opportunities and constraints; and
- develop a planning strategy and management recommendations for the study area.

1.5 Study Team

The study team included the following specialists from Godden Mackay Logan:

- Sheridan Burke, Director (project director, community consultation, recommendations, review);
- Robert Moore, Heritage Architect (fieldwork, assessments, community consultation, report input);
- Mark Dunn, Historian (historical research, community consultation, report input); and
- Bethan Farmer, graphics.

1.6 Terminology

In general, this report does not adopt any special terminology. The words 'place', 'cultural significance', 'fabric' and 'conservation' are in accordance with the definitions provided by the *Burra Charter* (The Australia ICOMOS Charter for the Places of Cultural Significance).

The word 'contributory', when used in relation to potential conservation areas, refers to the contribution that the property makes to the overall heritage values of the area. This contribution would mostly relate to historic and aesthetic values, but may in some circumstances also relate to technical and/or social values.

1.7 Acknowledgements

The study team wishes to acknowledge the considerable assistance provided by the following organisations and individuals:

- Hornsby Shire Council Officers:
 - James Farrington, Manager, Town Planning Services
 - Marianna Kucic, Strategic Planner
 - Christopher Reeves, Heritage Planner
 - Neil Chippendale, Local Studies Librarian
- The many property owners and residents who attended the community consultation sessions in 2004 and 2005, and made written comments, including:
 - Ruth and Leighton Frappell
 - Mr Don Waterworth
 - Ms Nancy Nossiter
 - Ms Christine Kirby



Figure 1.1 The Wahroonga (North) Study Area.

Historical Development

2.1 Pre-European Occupation

2.0

Aboriginal settlement in the Hornsby region, by the Ku-ring-gai and Dharug tribes, extends back to between 15,000 and 20,000 years prior to the arrival of Europeans. Over two hundred Aboriginal sites have been recorded in the Hornsby Shire area, including middens, grinding groove sites, stencil and painting sites, engraving sites and burial sites. They range throughout the Shire down to the edges of the Hawkesbury River.

As with other parts of Sydney, as more Europeans began to settle in the Hornsby area, the new settlers came into contact with the Aboriginal population, and often conflict followed. Conflict was most often the result of the dislocation of the Aboriginal population and their divorce from traditional hunting and living grounds. Between 1794–1800, twenty-six white settlers and an estimated two hundred Aborigines were killed.¹

By the 1820s and 1830s, most of the Aboriginal population had left, or been forced to leave, the Hornsby area.

2.2 Early European Occupation

Prior to the arrival of Europeans in the Wahroonga area, the study site would have been covered in stands of timber such as Sydney blue gum and grey ironbark, scribbly gums, banksias and tea trees. It was the timber that first encouraged Europeans to visit, and timber-getting crews were operating in the area from the 1820s. While the first timber cutters were convicts working in Government gangs, by the 1830s private timber merchants, such as Thomas Hyndes, had established themselves and began clearing timber for sale in Sydney.² Hyndes and another timber merchant, Aaron Pierce, were the two main land holders in the Wahroonga area, with their combined holdings covering from Fox Valley Road in the south, through Wahroonga and Hornsby. Hyndes, a timber contractor from 1815, removed vast stands of cedar, mahogany, turpentine, ironbark and blue gum from the land. From 1822 Hyndes formally leased the 2,000 acres to the east of the Lane Cove Road (Pacific Highway). In 1840 the land was re-leased to John Terry Hughes, a prominent merchant and brewer, to whom a deed grant was made out in 1842.

After the timber had been cleared, orchards were the main form of land usage in the area. The first citrus orchards appeared as early as the 1830s in some areas, but it was in the second half of the nineteenth century that they became a feature of the district.

After the death of Hughes in 1851, the land to the east of the Lane Cove Road was conveyed to businessmen Adolphous W Young, and afterward to William Whaley Billyard, Robert Vance, John Vance, H Day, William Billyard again and finally to Robert Burdett Smith and John Fitzgerald Burns, to be subdivided into large portions as The Big Island Estate in 1876. By 1878, these large portions

in turn began to be subdivided, and four major estates were gazetted in central Wahroonga—the Wahroonga Estate (1891, 1893); the Bundarra Estate (1892, 1893, 1895); the Wahroonga Heights Estate (1893, 1895); and the Railway Avenue Subdivision (1910).³

The study area is primarily comprised of the Bundarra Estate and the Wahroonga Heights Estate. Figure 2.1 shows the study area in relation to other grants and estates in and around Hornsby and Wahroonga.

2.3 The Railway

The proposal to build a North Shore railway, running from Hornsby to Milsons Point, was an important factor in the subdivision of many of the larger estates and orchards of the upper North Shore and Wahroonga area. The railway was first proposed in 1875, and by 1879–1880, the first surveys were being conducted for a line from Pearces Corner to the North Shore of the harbour. In 1883 the line was re-surveyed from St Leonards to Pearces Corner, with construction work beginning in August 1887. The railway line was opened in January 1890.⁴

The announcement of a railway along the North Shore, and the subsequent opening, initiated a rush of land speculation and subdivision. Whereas in the years before the railway the farms and estates had often stayed within the one family, the railway increased the pressure for building allotments and encouraged the first sales. Initially many of the buyers were members of Sydney's wealthier professional classes who could afford to commute to the town to work. Further, they were attracted by the higher altitude of the area, which was deemed to be healthier than the city and inner suburbs.⁵

One of the consequences of the city elite moving to the area was the appearance of a number of large architect-designed houses.

2.4 Notable Early Houses—The Highlands

The earliest remaining large architect-designed house within the study area is also one of the most exuberant examples of the architect-designed residences in Wahroonga. The Highlands was built in 1892–93 for Alfred Hordern and his wife Caroline. The house was built on twenty-four acres of bushland which the Horderns had purchased in July 1892. The block extended from Edgeworth David Road to the railway and from Myra Street to Bundarra Avenue. Land in the Wahroonga area had been chosen partly because of Alfred's ill health.⁶

The house was designed by Sydney architect John Horbury Hunt, in his North American 'shingle' style and is regarded as one the best examples of this type.⁷ Hunt had already designed a house in Rose Bay for another member of the Hordern family, and went on to design additions to the family store at Brickfield Hill, three new shops, a warehouse and another house. Hunt had arrived in Sydney in January 1863 from the United States of America (USA) en route to India. Hunt decided to stay in Sydney and began practising as an architect in Edmund Blacket's practice. By 1869 Hunt

was in private practice, where much of his early work was ecclesiastical. In 1871, with five colleagues, he formulated the rules of the proposed New South Wales Society for the Promotion of Architecture and Fine Arts, later renamed, on his suggestion, The Institute of Architects of New South Wales.⁸

The Highlands was originally surrounded by bushland, known as Horderns Bush, with formal gardens closer to the house (see Figure 2.7). The exotic garden was worked on at times by up to fourteen gardeners and included hydrangeas, azaleas, bulbs and rhododendrons, as well as many species collected on overseas trips. The gardens were well known in the district and were often opened for public inspection. In 1933 Caroline raised over £300 for Hornsby Hospital after an open weekend for her garden. The inspections attracted 3,000 visitors on the Saturday and 5,000 on Sunday.⁹

The subdivision pressure exerted on the property has resulted in the house's 'back' facing its street frontage.

2.5 Subdivision of the Estates

In contrast to the estates to the east and west, the study area was not subdivided and developed in a substantial way until later in the twentieth century. While there had been advertised sales in the area from the early 1890s, the focus of the subdivisions and development was to the south and west of the study area, between the railway line and the Lane Cove Road (now Pacific Highway), around the developing Wahroonga Village.

These early sales were part of the Bundarra Estate, named after the house Bundarra which was located at 22 Woonona Avenue, since demolished for the construction of the Newcastle Freeway. Figure 2.2 shows the first sales of the Bundarra Estate, with the smaller house lots set out to the south of the railway. Sales of the Bundarra Estate continued from 1892–1913, with a number of lots being offered for sale on a repeated basis until sold. Repeated sales were a common feature of the earlier subdivisions as more land was made available, and larger villa lots were re-subdivided to provide smaller residential/suburban lots. The subdivisions of the Bundarra Estate resulted in the creation of Bundarra Avenue, Churchill Avenue (originally also named Bundarra Avenue and presumably renamed after World War II), Ingalara Avenue (later partly renamed Fern Avenue), Millewa Avenue (later renamed Alexandria Avenue within the study area) and Woonona Avenue (see Figures 2.2–2.6)

One of the causes for the later development was the subdivision of The Highlands Estate. A 1930 aerial photograph (see Figure 2.7) shows the large amount of land that The Highlands Estate covered within the study area. The first section of the estate had been sold to the state government in 1923 for the construction of a school. The site was Myra Avenue and Junction Road (Edgeworth David Avenue) and was purchased for £1,250. The public school was opened in March 1927 with three classrooms, weather shed and toilets. In 1933 more land was purchased for the erection of the primary school, with some of the new portion being swapped for land fronting Edgeworth David

Avenue. The primary school was opened in 1939.¹⁰ Within the grounds of the primary school is a memorial to a student, Nellie Bower, who died at the school when a brick gate collapsed on her in 1933. The memorial was constructed by her father, a stonemason.¹¹

In 1932 Alfred Hordern, the owner of Highlands, died. The following year, in November 1933, the first subdivision sale of the Highlands Estate was advertised. Eighteen lots were offered for sale fronting Myra Street, Junction Road (later renamed Edgeworth David Avenue), Bundarra Avenue and Alexandria Parade. The house block and one adjacent were reserved from sale. Further sales through the 1930s reduced the Highlands Estate, while creating a number of the streets within the study area. Sales in June 1938 included the newly created street, Highlands Avenue, named after the principal house. The western end of Fern Avenue and Oleander Road were also created during this period (see Figures 2.8–2.9 and 2.12–2.13). It would appear that not all the lots facing Highlands Avenue were sold at this time. The land between Fern Street and the primary school was occupied by the military during World War II for use as a transport depot.¹²

Subdivision for residential development was still occurring within the study area through the 1950s and later. The land surrounding the Federation house Neringla, built 1895, was subdivided into seventeen allotments in June 1950, with later land sales from the same estate continuing through to the 1980s.

2.6 Housing Development During the Interwar and Post-war Period

The comparatively late subdivision of The Highlands Estate and the post-war subdivision of the Neringla Estate influenced the style of housing within the study area. Modern, creative styles were beginning to be used in domestic architecture, and a number of properties within the study area display these trends. Examples of California Bungalow, Spanish Mission, Moderne and Sydney School style project homes are all present within the study area. These houses sit alongside the earlier remnant estate houses and large Federation houses, creating a diverse palette of architectural styles through the study area.

Of particular interest are the few project homes that are present. During the 1950s and early 1960s, a collection of budding Sydney architects began to develop a regional style suited to the many and varied landscapes of Sydney.

During the late 1950s and early 1960s, Sydney suburbia and Australian cities in general were undergoing a transformation in home ownership and development. While the immediate post-World War II period had been characterised by thrifty owner-builders, small contract builders and speculative development, the 1950s witnessed the emergence of a new market of home buyers seeking a more sophisticated product.

One result of the newfound spending power was a change in the marketing of new houses. The early 1960s was notable for the expansion of project builders into the housing market, some of whom

employed architects to design houses. The collaboration of merchant builder and architect in the project home concept established them as a very popular choice for new home builders and buyers in the 1960s and 1970s. Architect-designed houses had previously been confined to the upper end of the house building market in Australia, available only to those who had enough money to pay for the innovation and time that was involved in individual private commissions. While a number of architect-designed houses already existed in the study area, the project house was primarily marketed to a rising middle-class buyer who was interested in a distinct, quality home but did not or could not enter into the cost of individual architect design.

Although not dominant, there are examples of this style of housing within the Wahroonga (North) area.

Some indication of the development within the study area can be ascertained by the figures for dwelling construction within Hornsby Shire. Between 1933 and 1954 the number of dwellings rose from 5450 to 11,902, and to 22,074 in 1966.¹³

2.7 Analysis of the Subdivision Patterns

The study area is made up of a compilation of subdivisions of historic estates. Subdivision of these estates began in 1892 with the first sales of the Bundarra Estate. The Bundarra Estate was subdivided on at least four occasions, with the first large block sites being progressively resubdivided into smaller allotments. While this is the first example of subdivision within the study area, it is also the estate that has undergone the most change and is the least recognisable, in terms of the lot size, shape and alignment, in comparison to the other historic estates. Although the pattern of some of these early Bundarra Estate sales can still be seen to some extent in blocks fronting Bundarra Avenue close to Alexandria Street, the building of the Sydney–Newcastle freeway severely disrupted the pattern of the early subdivision. Further, many of the remaining blocks have been resubdivided or had battle-axe blocks created to accommodate more development. However, two lots in Woonona Avenue retain large Federation-era houses on them—42 Woonona Avenue (Cherrygarth) and 46 Woonona Avenue (Neringla), with the accompanying yards, which give some idea of the allotment size and development pattern of the earliest subdivision.

The allotments from later sale of land from the Bundarra Estate in 1913 and then the sale of the Wahroonga Heights Estate in the 1920s are still largely visible at Wahroonga (North). These sales were centred around Ingalara Avenue, Bundarra Avenue (renamed Churchill Avenue), Fern Avenue and Junction Street (renamed Edgeworth David Avenue). The two main sales were between Churchill Avenue and Woonona Avenue in 1913 (Bundara Estate Ingalara portion) and Ingalara Avenue and Churchill Avenue in 1926 (Wahroonga Heights Estate). The overall pattern of both of these sales, which make up most of the northern portion of the study area, remains clear in lot size and street frontage. Churchill Avenue retains the seventeen blocks as shown (on its western side) in

the 1926 sale notice, with Ingalara Avenue also intact except for an amalgamated allotment on the corner of Fern Avenue (see Figures 2.5 and 2.6).

The same is essentially true for the final pattern of subdivision of the Highlands Estate. The Highlands Estate occupied the greater extent of the western portion of the study area from the railway line to Edgeworth David Avenue, and was subdivided at a later stage than the surrounding estates, with the first sales occurring in 1933. It is the pattern created in the second sale on 1938 that remains distinctly evident within the study area. The first sale offered eighteen lots, most of one acre or more in size, excluding seven acres around The Highlands house and a two acre block adjacent. However it appears that few of these sold because in 1938, all the lots south of the newly-created Park Avenue (now renamed Oleander Road) were again offered for sale, as were eleven new lots created from the nine acres around The Highlands that had been previously excluded. The new subdivision plan created Highlands Avenue, with its distinctive bend skirting the street frontage of The Highlands. Although the block on which The Highlands stands was subsequently re-divided to create two battleaxe blocks and two extra street front lots, the remaining 1938 subdivision is clear in the allotments as they remain to date.

Overall, while there are a number of battleaxe allotments and re-subdivisions within the study area, the intention and layout of the early subdivisions can still be discerned within the Wahroonga (North) study area. The significance of the early subdivision pattern in contributing to the character of the area is still evident, despite some variation.

2.8 The Sydney–Newcastle Freeway Construction

In 1989 the Sydney–Newcastle freeway was opened. The freeway had been first proposed in 1948, following the course of Spring Gully Creek, the boundary between the Parishes of Gordon and South Colah, and the boundary between Hornsby Shire and Ku-ring-gai Shire. Throughout the 1970s and 1980s, property acquisitions were underway along the freeway route and by 1984, construction of road bridges over Edgeworth David Avenue and railway bridges had commenced.¹⁴

The freeway caused significant disturbances in the local road pattern and within the study area. Bridges were constructed in Edgeworth David Avenue and Alexandria Parade, both of which bore increased traffic loads as some other streets disappeared or were altered. Bundarra Avenue was cut a second time (the first having been by the railway some one hundred years previous) and the southern section of Woonona Avenue, along with a number of the houses in it, was removed. Lochville Street and Bareena Avenue were also split by the freeway.



Figure 2.1 1893 plan of grants and estates in the Hornsby and Wahroonga areas. The study area is outlined, running north from the railway line. The large orchard and farm estates prior to suburbanisation are clearly illustrated in this plan. (Source: Ku-ring-gai Local Studies Library)



Figure 2.2 The first sale of the Bundarra Estate in 1892. Most of the smaller residential subdivision was focused to the south of the study area between the railway and the Lane Cove Road, as this was closer to the developing village of Wahroonga. The study area is within Section 3. (Source: Hornsby Local Studies Library)



Figure 2.3 The second of the Bundarra Estate in 1893. None of the lots in the study area were sold in the first sale. They have subsequently been re-subdivided to smaller residential allotments. Note also the extension of Bundarra Avenue and Millewa Avenue. (Source: Hornsby Local Studies Library)



Figure 2.4 The third sale of the Bundarra Estate. A number of lots from the previous sale have been taken up in the study area, although there appears to be little development, with houses indicated on lots south of the railway line. This plan also shows the developing pattern of allotments in the eastern portion of the study area, with the creation of Bundarra Avenue (north), later renamed Churchill Avenue. (Source: Hornsby Local Studies Library)



Figure 2.5 A 1913 sale of a portion of the Bundarra Estate. This sale created the allotments that largely remain unchanged in this section of the study area. (Source: Hornsby Local Studies Library)



Figure 2.6 1926 sale of part of the Wahroonga Heights Estate in October 1926. As with the previous figure, the pattern of subdivision for this estate remains largely in the same format in the present format of allotments. (Source: Hornsby Local Studies Library)



Figure 2.7 1930 aerial photograph of the study area. The large Highlands Estate dominates much of the study area. As yet not subdivided, the photo clearly shows the house and formal garden and the surrounding bushland. Waitara Public School occupies the northwest corner of the block. Comparison with the previous subdivision plans also shows that despite the ongoing subdivision sales, comparatively little development has occurred in the area. (Source: Hornsby Shire Council)



Figure 2.8 The Highlands c1940s. The Highlands was the first substantial house built in the study area, with its estate including most of the land in the western half. Its delayed subdivision (compared to other areas) played an important part in the development of the Wahroonga (North) area. (Source: Historic Houses Trust, John Horbury Hunt : Radical Architect 1838–1904)



Figure 2.9 The first subdivision of the Highlands Estate for residential allotments. This estate was the last of the large estates in the area. Its subdivision defined the street layout and development of the western side of the study area. (Source: Hornsby Local Studies Library)



Figure 2.10 A Water Board survey plan of part of the study area, February 1937. This figure, when compared to Figures 2.5 and 2.6, shows the relatively small amount of development that has occurred between the subdivision sales in 1926 and 1937. (Source: Water Board Plans Room DS 1989)



Figure 2.11 This Water Board Survey from May 1937 shows part of the study area adjacent to the Sydney–Newcastle Freeway. The streets in this section were severely dislocated with the construction of the Freeway. The freeway cut through Spring Valley Creek and resulted in the demolition of the houses shown here facing Lochville Street, Douglas Street and the complete removal of Coonanbarra Road. (Source: Sydney Water Plans Room DS 2015)



Figure 2.12 1955 aerial photograph showing the study site area. A comparison with figure 2.7 shows the rapid infill that has occurred during the 25 year period. Notice particularly the subdivision and development around Highlands and the curved Highlands Avenue. (Source: Hornsby Council)



Figure 2.13 The second sale of the Highlands Estate showing the creation of Highlands Avenue and Park Avenue, later renamed Fern Ave in the east and Oleander Ave in the west. Later sales gradually reduced the Highlands house site and removed the Myra Street access. (Source: Hornsby Local Studies Library)



Figure 2.14 One of the last large subdivision sales in the study area, the Neringla Estate in June 1950. The allotment pattern created in this sale remains largely intact in the current allotments. Sections of this estate were still being subdivided in the 1980s. (Source: Hornsby Local Studies Library)

2.9 Endnotes

- ¹ David Watts Aboriginal Heritage Consultants, Aboriginal Sites and Culture in the Hornsby Shire, Hornsby Shire Council.
- ² Kass, T 1993, Hornsby Shire Heritage Study Volume 1 Thematic Study, p 7.
- ³ Godden Mackay Logan, 2000, Ku-ring-gai Residential Development Strategy: Heritage and Neighbour Character Study, prepared for Ku-ring-gai Municipal Council, p 327.
- ⁴ Clark, LA 1976, *North of the Harbour: A Brief History of Transport to and on the North Shore*, ARHS, Sydney, p 118.
- ⁵ Kass, op cit, p 17.
- ⁶ Society, p 20.
- ⁷ ibid.
- ⁸ Reynolds P, Muir L & J Hughes 2002, *John Horbury Hunt: Radical Architect 1838–1904*, Historic Houses Trust of New South Wales, p 10.
- ⁹ Ramage, I 1991, Wahroonga: Our Home, p 46.
- ¹⁰ Ramage, op cit, p 145.
- ¹¹ ibid, p 145.
- ¹² Pers comm, Ruth Frappell to Robert Moore, 9 January 2005.
- ¹³ Kass, op cit, p 23.
- ¹⁴ O'Callaghan, op cit, p 152.

Godden Mackay Logan

3.0

Character

3.1 Description of the Study Area

The study area is unequivocally defined by a combination of local arterial streets and the emphatic physical boundaries provided by the North Shore Railway Line and the Northern Freeway. Myra Street and Edgeworth David Ave—important local arterials derived from the early land grants and estates—now combine with the powerful barriers of the railway and freeway (ironically each the grand transport gestures of their age) to set the study area aside as a recognisable, distinct precinct. The simple grid pattern of streets and subdivision estates characteristic of the Upper North Shore has been laid over the undulating Hornsby–Ku-ring-gai plateau, in an extension of the character of the neighbouring Hornsby and Ku-ring-gai streets and precincts—only to be disrupted by the swathes cut through by the rail line and the freeway.

Within the delineating 'edges', the area is compartmentalised by the north-south aligned streets determined by extension of the earlier subdivisions to the south, for example Bundarra Avenue, and Woonona Avenue. There is effectively only one east-west street—Fern Avenue which, with Oleander Street, allows for internal circulation and access/egress for the residents. North of Fern Avenue are Ingalara and Churchill Avenues, derived from the regular, even and tidy subdivisions and bungalow development of the 1930s.

What immediately impresses about the study area is the consistently generous gardened blocks on which its homes are sited, with the skyline dominated by both street and rear garden plantings of native forest trees, many of them now mature and very tall. On these mostly substantial lots are good quality, representative examples of homes from across the development period of the Area— and the North Shore in general. Of particular interest, however, is the mix of examples from different development periods which, when assisted by an understanding of their very 'local' histories, compose an area which is both aesthetically impressive and historically interpretable. The surviving houses and their overall setting are both pleasing and readily understandable.

3.2 Development Layout

As with much of the residential development of the North Shore, the study area is not laid out in any formally designed or composed way. The street and block layouts reflect standard subdivision practice and the extension of residential subdivision northwards from the Lane Cove Road and the railway line. Perhaps the greatest influences have been the endurance of some of the earlier grand estates, especially The Highlands of the Hordern Family (9 Highlands Avenue), and others in Bundarra Avenue (for example Landskrona, 48 Bundarra Avenue and the 'Stockbroker's Tudor' mansion at 50 Bundarra Avenue) and Woonona Avenue (Cherrygarth, 42 Woonona Avenue and Neringla, 46 Woonona Avenue).

The resistance of the Hordern Family (and probably in particular its devoted matriarch Carrie Hordern) to the break-up of The Highlands saw its extensive gardens and bush-covered grounds survive as a remarkable entity at first only reduced by the sale of land to enable the development of Waitara Public, the local primary school. Successive subdivision plans thereafter show how the curvilinear line of Highlands Avenue stepped around the grand house and at first, it retained its formal carriage entrance and approach garden accessed from Myra Street. This access was, however, also to give way to yet another home site as the curved line of Highlands Avenue, and its northward extension towards the rear of the primary school, supported the most effective and intense division of the old estate into house blocks, with the depth needed for the residual Highlands block enabling the later battleaxe subdivision of two similarly deep lots to its north.

The regular, conventional dissection of the Ingalara and Churchill Avenue lands in the 1930s, supporting quality bungalow homes in generous garden settings, can be contrasted with the jigsaw puzzle of irregular lots in the block defined by Bundarra, Fern and Woonona Avenues, Alexandria Parade and the freeway. The re-subdivisions and evermore intense use of sites are evident both on the ground and in the study area plans, although the canopy trees and old garden shrubberies still provide effective camouflage.

3.3 Streetscape and Building Stock

The study area's streetscapes can be considered to present as two categories:

- the earlier grand estates and 'first subdivisions', with their mixture of house periods and styles, upon a variety of sites that have been variously adjusted through re-subdivision for closer settlement; the southern reaches of Bundarra, Woonona and Highlands Avenues exhibit this category; and
- 2. the later interwar subdivisions, which have produced more consistent street groupings of houses, notably consistent in period, style and character within their groups; Ingalara, Churchill and the northern range of Woonona Avenue exhibit this category, with more examples in Myra street and the northern part of Highlands Avenue.

Common to both types is the generosity of space around and between the houses concerned, supporting mature gardens with substantial shrubberies, and major native forest canopy trees. Consolidating this are the major street tree groupings, some of which have been listed as heritage components of the Shire in their own right (Myra, Woonona, Bundarra and Fern Streets). The treed, vegetated character of the Study area is perhaps the single most effective linking component of the precinct, tying its housing and streetscapes together. The grassed and swaled verges either side of the road further soften the streets' appearance. Underpinning this are the generally substantial lot sizes that support the larger front and side garden setbacks, contributing to the streetscape character, along with the larger rear yards that support garages and outbuildings behind the dwellings they serve.

The Late Victorian–Federation period saw the beginnings of closer residential settlement in Hornsby and Ku-ring-gai, and the study area includes both the smaller timber built cottages (27 Churchill Avenue) and the larger brick and tile Queen Anne Revival mansions (Cherrygarth and Neringla) which represent the style and period across the broader area. The Highlands is, of course, an exceptional house and the stand-out house of the study area, an unusual Late Victorian Free Style mansion by the architect Horbury Hunt. Its reduced curtilage is regrettable and a salutory lesson on the need to continually monitor and evaluate the subdivision of older properties where this might still occur, and especially for seminally important houses like this one.

The main feature, however, of the study area is its collection of Inter-War bungalows, with a consistency of style, scale, bulk and site arrangement The earlier, more historically styled cottages, built of fine brickwork or rendered masonry with tiled roofs and often detailed embellishments like columns and timber joinery, are complemented by later 'Moderne' style dwellings, also variously brick and render and again with tiled roofs, but harder trim such as steel-framed windows and doors.

Ingalara Avenue is the most notable group of cottages, established and consolidated in the late 1930s and 1940s, and becoming a celebrated street of quality homes, attracting the media attention of the day. Some longer-term residents of the street, living in the homes their parents built, still retain the architects' plans and specifications for their homes, and know the successive owners and stories of their street. The street's fine cottages exhibit the full range of North Shore styles and interests with the Georgian Revival of Number 22, the austere but nonetheless decorative brickwork of Number 32, the remarkable white box modernism of Number 15, and the confident two-storey scale and impressiveness of Number 31.

Myra Street also features a good range of Inter-War Bungalows developed after the capitulation of the Horderns to the commercial pressures for breaking up The Highlands estate. Extending from Alexandria Parade to the southern boundary of the public school, the group also features a noticeable consistency of overall house placement, setbacks, scale and palette of materials. Here the notable example is 26–28 Myra Street, a very substantial blue brick bungalow extending across its broad site, and said by locals to have been 'the doctor's house'. An ambitious house of generous proportions, this home features a southern-side 'porte cochere' over its driveway, leading to the handsome rear-mounted garage. Complemented by a fine front garden wall and a now-mature garden with many substantial trees, this is a fine example of the better class Inter-War bungalow of the North Shore.

While the strong streetscape groups attract attention, there are also many fine individual homes whose quality 'shows through' and which warrant further enquiry and assessment. Several larger homes set in large grounds and gardens are of interest and the gardens of some are already listed— 42, 58–60 and 64 Bundarra Avenue are all of interest, as are 8 Highlands (Georgian Revival), and 2B Highlands (also known as 79 Alexandria Parade—designed in a Mediterranean-influenced Georgian style). Smaller, individual cottages that exhibit strong design qualities and identity are also scattered throughout the Area's streets (58 and 60 Woonona Avenue).

The taste for contemporary homes in the 1960s and 1970s appears to have found little foothold in the study area, with only a few examples of such homes to broaden the periods and styles represented, but it is clear that in the last ten years, some re-subdivisions and individual redevelopment of properties for new replacement homes are having an impact upon the character of the study area. A number of new two-storey homes have been built on the site of demolished earlier dwellings, and their scale and bulk, materials and overall character make them stand out as different to their earlier neighbours. Particularly noticeable are the reduced, often minimal garden setbacks, leaving little space between these houses and their boundaries or their neighbours, or room for garden plantings, especially shrubs and trees. Also a new dominant force in front gardens is the large paved entrance driveway and front-located garage, distinct from the old side driveway wheel tracks and rear garages.

In summary, the potential Conservation Area is of interest for the manner in which it illustrates the evolution of closer settlement on Sydney's Upper North Shore—from the initial land grants and timber-getting interests, to the grand estates of the merchant-gentry, to the eventual subdivision of cottage lots. It still reflects the area's historical pre-occupation with single-family housing, uninterrupted by commercial intrusions, and the only non-residential use to enter the area is the local primary school.

Heritage Values

4.1 Principles

4.0

The concept of 'cultural significance' or 'heritage value' embraces the values of a place or item. Assessment of cultural significance endeavours to establish why a place or item is considered important and is valued by the community. Cultural significance is embodied in the fabric of the place (including its setting and relationship to other items), the records associated with the place and the response that the place evokes in the community.

The Burra Charter: the Australia ICOMOS Charter for the Places of Cultural Significance 1999 and its Guidelines for Assessment of Cultural Significance recommend that significance be assessed in categories such as aesthetic, historic, scientific and social significance.

The *NSW Heritage Manual,* published by the NSW Heritage Office, outlines a total of seven criteria for significance assessment. Five of these cover the same four categories of significance found in The Burra Charter, with two criteria for assessing the comparative significance of an item.

Since the preparation of the *NSW Heritage Manual*, the *Heritage Act 1977* (NSW) was amended in 1999. As part of this amendment, the NSW Heritage Office has adopted revised criteria for assessment of heritage significance. The evaluation of cultural significance in the following sections is based on these revised criteria. These are broadly consistent with the criteria contained in the Burra Charter and the *NSW Heritage Manual*.

4.2 Why the Wahroonga (North) Area is Significant

The potential Wahroonga (North) Conservation Area is one of the historically and visually distinctive areas of Hornsby in which the integrity and quality of development pattern, streetscapes and buildings exhibit a rich combination of heritage values for the local community. The subdivision pattern of the area remains true to its historical evolution, retaining the principal streets and reflecting the successively closer utilisation of the land for its characteristic detached residential development. Of particular interest in the area is the long formative influence of one of its great estates, The Highlands, whose eventual loss to subdivision, leaving the important house upon a sadly reduced curtilage, is one of the unfortunate heritage conservation themes of the North Shore. The area has also been shaped by the railway and northern freeway, the principal transport developments of the district.

Contrasting subdivision patterns in the precincts of the area reflect the break-up of the old estates, with irregular blocks and access handled lots comparable with the regular, serried rows of blocks created in the late 1930s. Within this pattern, a diverse collection of detached single-family housing has developed, including important representative examples of both late-nineteenth and early-twentieth-century domestic architecture, combined with important later Inter-War cottages of high

quality, many of them architect-designed. The integrity and aesthetic qualities of the area's streetscapes and buildings are given extra interest and appeal, and the character and individuality of the area emphasised, by the presence of remnant native forest trees. These, together with the dense native and exotic tree and garden plantings of the area, complement the architecture of its houses and evoke that distinctive (and threatened) North Shore bushland character, of which this small precinct is still decidedly a part. The majority of buildings within the area are either contributory or heritage items.

4.3 Heritage Significance Assessment

Under the Heritage Act, an item will be considered to be of State or Local heritage significance if, in the opinion of the Heritage Council of NSW, it meets one or more of the key criteria set out in the Guidelines published by the NSW Heritage Office. These criteria are equally applicable to a building or movable chattel or relic or structure of building or a Conservation Area. Considered against these criteria, the Wahroonga (North) area is considered to meet the inclusion guidelines for Local Significance as follows:

a) An item is important in the course, or pattern, of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area).

The Wahroonga (North) area is important in the history of Hornsby Shire as a part of the area's consolidation as a residential area of high quality and amenity. It reflects the evolution of the Shire from timber-getting through to merchants' retreats and estates to the bush suburb idyll it still represents. In that the area is associated with a significant activity or phase, it conforms with the inclusion guidelines.

b) An item has strong or special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in the cultural or natural history of NSW (or the cultural or natural history of the local area).

The character of the potential Conservation Area has been strongly influenced by the long endurance, but eventual subdivision of, the Hordern Family Estate, the Highlands, largely because of the commitment to the Estate of the family matriarch, Caroline ('Carrie') Hordern. Typical of the upper North Shore, the area has had notable residents from the arts and politics; for example, the late Robert Klippel, an important noteworthy Australian sculptor, and Sir Howard Beale, local representative in parliament and cabinet minister. The area is therefore demonstrated to be associated with significant local persons.
c) An item is important in demonstrating aesthetic characteristics and/or a high degree of creative or technical achievement in NSW (or the local area).

The potential Conservation Area is aesthetically distinctive, owing to the presence of a fine collection of residential dwellings of different periods and styles, but unified and made complimentary by their bushland setting.

d) An item has strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group in NSW (or the local area) for social, cultural or spiritual reasons.

The potential Conservation Area has a demonstrated importance to its community's sense of place, expressed in the community consultation undertaken by Council to discover attitudes to the proposed implementation of the Conservation Area.

e) An item has potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area).

The potential Conservation Area retains an important capacity to reveal more about its significance through research and physical surveying, contributing to the community's better understanding of its history. In this capacity, it is arguably an important reference site for Hornsby.

f) An item possesses uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area).

The potential Conservation Area demonstrates residential development exhibiting qualities that are rare within Hornsby and which are endangered by continuing unsympathetic development activity.

In the Highlands and the fine housing of Ingalara Avenue, it has a property of exceptional interest and a streetscape of rare quality, amenity and integrity for the Hornsby LGA.

- g) An item is important in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of NSW's:
 - cultural or natural places; or
 - cultural or natural environments

(or a class of the local areas'

- cultural or natural places; or
- cultural or natural environments.)

In its collection of largely intact and harmonious housing, outstanding within Hornsby for their quality and integrity as a largely contemporary group, and complemented by their remarkable bushland suburban setting, the area is arguably of high local importance to Hornsby. The Act states that an item can be both of State heritage significance and Local heritage significance. The Highlands is clearly such an item. However, apart from this extraordinary house, the potential Conservation Area is of similar interest to other high quality, high integrity areas which are important to their communities at a local level.

4.4 Comparative Assessment

In order to better identify the heritage values of the potential Wahroonga (North) Conservation Area by comparative analysis, relevant comparable areas have to be found and there appear to be several that are of use within Hornsby itself. There are also the conservation areas and comparable residential areas of the northern Ku-ring-gai Municipality, some of which actually adjoin the Study Area.

As the potential Conservation Area grew out of northward extension of streets and subdivision estates from around Wahroonga Station and Village, it is not surprising that, in development pattern, the area's growth and evolution resembles that of northern Ku-ring-gai to its south and east. The National Trust has recognised Urban Conservation Areas in these localities and these are under review for Ku-ring-gai Council. Generally, these areas are larger in extent and perhaps, through being closer to the railway transport corridor, they have a greater proportion of earlier homes (in the Victorian and Edwardian/Federation styles).

The story of dominant local family estates, succeeded by subdivision and a sequence of housing periods and styles through the Interwar and post war periods, is typical of Ku-ring-gai but also of other parts of Hornsby: Beecroft and Cheltenham. The Wahroonga (North) Conservation Area is distinguished, however, by its small size, effectively delineated by the railway and freeway corridors, and local arterial roads, and by the remarkable and dominant influence of The Highlands Estate. The Hordern Family holdings endured longer and occupied proportionally more of the Wahroonga (North) area than comparable early estates in nearby suburbs.

While the earlier pattern of subdivision is typical of, and comparable with, northern Ku-ring-gai notably in its irregular street layout and highly variable block sizes—the later and more regular bungalow developments of Ingalara Avenue, Myra Street and Churchill Avenue are different. Similar dark brick and rendered bungalows are found closer to the city in the later subdivisions of Killara and East Lindfield, and parts of Turramurra, for instance. The appearance of these houses in the Wahroonga (North) area is likely an outcome of the mixture of opportunity (the availability of the land) and the perceived proximity to transport routes.

In the Heritage Assessment of the Interwar houses of Rosebank Avenue, Epping, prepared by CPC Consultants for Hornsby Shire Council (2003), Catherine Colville assembled a basic comparison of all the Interwar period housing estates developed within Hornsby. Most of the 'estates' reviewed were small single or part-street developments, most of which were said to have sustained substantial change to their subdivision patterns. Many were said to have been developed with 'an eclectic mix of

styles'. Only two were noted as being significantly intact—Rosebank Avenue, Epping, and Rosen's Estate (Rosen and Fernhill Streets). The Wahroonga Heights Estate (Ingalara Avenue, Bundarra Avenue and Churchill Avenue) is noted as being comprised of three street frontages and an eclectic mix of building styles, with several changes to the subdivision layout.

The documentary research and field work carried out for this report suggests that the Interwar housing of Wahroonga (North) is of good quality and high intactness. The mix of style and design is typical—and in Ingalara Avenue, and Myra Street, there is an obvious harmony and contemporaneity of the development.

However, what delivers the final component of the area's distinctive character is its remarkable retention of the high tree canopy, with its skylines and streetscapes variously framed and screened by the street and garden stands of tall forest species. While the residential development of the Conservation Area is full of character in its rich mix and detail, its true individuality arguably derives from the manner in which it is overlain with 'urban forest' to create the bush suburb persona that may be the Conservation Area's most enduring significance. Current day and likely future development pressures encouraging the removal and non-replacement of large and forest tree species clearly suggest that the bush suburbs of the upper North Shore are a threatened type.

Significance	Level of Significance
Historic	Local
Historic Associative	Local
Aesthetic/Creative	Local
Social	*
Research	Local
Rarity	Local
Representativeness	Local

4.5 Summary Evaluation of Significance

* No specific survey of social significance has been undertaken. However, members of the community have consistently expressed high regard for the area at workshops and in submissions.

4.6 Significant Characteristics of the Wahroonga (North) Conservation Area

The pattern of houses and blocks constitutes evidence of the gradually evolving subdivision
pattern, extending from the estates of the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries, to the
generous cottage subdivisions of the pre-World War I and interwar years, to the ever smaller
blocks (with increasingly larger houses) of the later twentieth century.

- The predominant land use remains exclusively that of detached residences on single lots, with the local primary school the only intrusion.
- There is a notable variation in lot sizes and shapes, derived of the early estate and street patterns, and the subdivision plans adopted.
- The area still features generous garden settings, with private gardens to front and rear (frequently also to the side), and widths generally sufficient to provide for landscaped setbacks, driveways to rear-sited garages, and high levels of privacy and amenity between dwellings.
- Examples of substantial, largely intact and significant homes from the Late Victorian and Federation periods, encompassing the major architectural styles of those times with significant individual examples.
- Examples of good, characteristic interwar-period houses, in styles ranging across the Old English, Mediterranean and Californian Bungalow fashions (eg 58 Woonona Avenue and 26–28 Myra Street) with some early 'Moderne' examples (eg 15 Ingalara Avenue) and a small group of austere postwar cottages in Lochville Street and Douglas Avenues.
- Examples of interesting, more modest mid-to-late twentieth-century houses, some of them on smaller lots created by comparative late subdivisions (eg 2A Highlands Avenue). There are also numbers of recently built houses of larger scale on comparatively smaller blocks with less landscaping.
- While there currently appears to be a comparatively small number of Heritage Items in the area, there is a large number of properties that are contributory to the Conservation Area.
- There are a number of non-contributory properties which offer important opportunities for appropriately contextual re-development within the area.
- The area does not include any significant public open space. The only public buildings are those in the Waitara Public School, whose grounds form the largest open landscaped space within the Conservation Area.
- Significant mature street tree plantings (such as those in Myra Street, Bundarra Avenue and Churchill Avenue) contribute to the marked bushland character and tree-covered amenity of the area as a whole. These are complemented by the high number of tall native forest trees which have been retained within private gardens and back yards.
- In many streets the bitumen road surfaces have grassed verges with grassed swale drains rather than kerbs and gutters.
- There is a wide variety of front fences, many of which are low, and usually combined with hedge and screen plantings. Many of the more carefully designed and original houses are

complemented by appropriately composed front fences which, with the plantings used, do not divorce houses from the street.

- Dividing fences are mostly timber framed with palings or wire, and are screened by garden plantings.
- Surviving earlier garages are not set forward from the homes they serve, but are set mainly behind the building line or behind the house, making them less noticeable in streetscapes. Driveways and paved areas are generally secondary in terms of area to the soft landscaping in the street and front gardens of the older homes, whereas new houses tend to have large paved driveway aprons.

4.7 Statement of Significance

The Wahroonga North Conservation Area is significant within Hornsby for its compact, representative demonstration of major themes and development periods in the history of the Shire. The distinctive qualities and retained integrity of its diverse subdivision pattern, streetscapes and houses, coalesced within its enduring bush suburban setting, support its recognition and management as a Conservation Area of Local Significance to Hornsby and the Upper North Shore.

Precisely bounded by local and regional transport corridors, the Conservation Area still reflects its formative component subdivisions and retains a richly illustrative collection of housing periods and styles particularly between the 1930s and 1950s. Notable amongst these are the Horbury Hunt-designed Hordern Family residence, The Highlands, whose endurance as a large estate delayed closer subdivision and shaped the street pattern and housing mix of the Conservation Area. Significant numbers of Interwar and postwar Bungalows, such as the fine group in Ingalara Avenue, also figure in its distinctive character.

Godden Mackay Logan

Heritage Items

5.1 Existing Heritage Items

5.0

Within the study area, there are fifteen heritage items identified by the Hornsby Shire Local Environmental Plan (see Figure 5.1). Of these, eight are houses and the remaining seven are identified gardens. Of the eight houses identified, three of these listings also include the gardens. Further, 9 Highlands Avenue, The Highlands, is registered on the State Heritage Register.

5.2 Contributory Items

A major objective in the management of a conservation area is to retain evidence of its history, as well as other considerations such as aesthetic values. For this reason, in order to retain the significance of a conservation area, as a matter of principle, buildings and elements that contribute to the overall heritage value of a conservation area must be kept. The principal objective for the management of heritage items is stated in the Hornsby Shire Local Environmental Plan 1994, as follows:

(18) To provide for continuity with the past by conserving the heritage of the Hornsby area and to ensure that Aboriginal heritage is preserved and conserved wherever possible.

The significance and setting of contributory items should also be retained, although there may be greater scope for sympathetic change than for heritage items.

During this study, each property within the Wahroonga (North) study area has been assessed (from the public domain) for its contribution to the significance of the area, as described in the Statement of Significance. Buildings that have been assessed as contributing to that significance have been identified as contributory items, together with existing listed heritage items in a schedule and map for the area included as Figure 5.1. The two categories are described as follows:

- Heritage Item: A previously identified item that is listed as a heritage item in the Hornsby Shire Local Environmental Plan 1994 Schedule D. These items also contribute to the heritage significance of the conservation area.
- Contributory Item: A place, building or other feature that contributes to the significance of the
 conservation area or precinct, usually for its historic or aesthetic values, or both. Upon further
 research and investigation, some may potentially be heritage items in their own right.
 Contributory items may also include some buildings whose appearance has been adversely
 altered but which still demonstrate historic values of significance to the area.

During the fieldwork, a number of properties were noted as requiring further investigation to establish their heritage significance. They have been identified as potential heritage items and include:

15 Ingalara Avenue;

- 22 Ingalara Avenue;
- 26-28 Myra Street;
- 58 Woonona Avenue;
- 60 Woonona Avenue;
- 42 Bundarra Avenue;
- 58–60 Bundarra Avenue;
- 4 Highlands Avenue;
- 79 Alexandria Parade; and
- 64 Bundarra Avenue.

The remaining buildings have been assessed as buildings that do not contribute to the heritage significance of the area. These buildings may have a benign or neutral effect on the area, in which case Council would not require their retention, provided that they are replaced with a building that has a benign or more positive impact. Some buildings may even be intrusive and detract from the area, in which case Council would, in the long term, encourage their replacement by a building that is more compatible with the characteristics that define the significance of the conservation area.

The thresholds between buildings identified as contributory and those that do not contribute to the significance of the area have been carefully considered. A contributory building, even though it may have been substantially altered, should be recognisable as one that relates to the significance of the area. It may be an Interwar building that has unsympathetic additions, or it may have been rendered. In such cases, it may still retain and be able to demonstrate historic values, even though its aesthetic values have been diminished. In the longer term, its aesthetic values may be recoverable, as experienced in examples elsewhere. However, where a building has been altered to the extent that its aesthetic values have been lost and are unlikely ever to be recovered, and its historical values are discernible only with the greatest difficulty, then the item is no longer considered to be contributory.

A small number of items of outstanding cultural significance may not fit into the key aspects of significance mentioned in the Statement of Significance. These are also identified as contributory, as they contribute to the significance of the area and are integral to the heritage significance of the Shire of Hornsby overall.

It is recommended that Council manage the buildings and elements within the area in accordance with these values.



Figure 5.1 Study Area Wahroonga (North) Potential Heritage Conservation Area, showing existing heritage items, contributory items and potential heritage items.

Godden Mackay Logan

6.0

Management Policies, Development Guidelines and Controls

6.1 Introduction

This section explains how the special character and heritage value of the Wahroonga (North) Heritage Conservation Area (HCA) can be safeguarded through the adoption of the management and development control strategy laid out below.

6.2 General Management Policy

6.2.1 Objectives

- 1. Retain the heritage significance and significant characteristics of the HCA.
- Allow removal/alteration of uncharacteristic features that detract from the significance of the HCA.
- 3. Retain and conserve heritage items and contributory items (ie those identified as contributing to the significance of the HCA).
- 4. Retain the significant landscaped characteristics of the HCA, including the garden setting of residences, enhanced by street planting and grass verges, and the tree canopy of exotic and indigenous vegetation that permeates the area.
- 5. Encourage the reconstruction of heritage items and contributory items that have been unsympathetically altered.
- 6. Ensure that development is compatible with the heritage significance and significant characteristics of the HCA. Development should respect the principles contained in the Burra Charter.

6.3 Management Processes

The following management processes should be implemented:

- The HCA should be listed as a conservation area in the Hornsby Local Environmental Plan and be managed in accordance with statutory heritage planning provisions and a Heritage Development Control Plan (DCP).
- In recognition of the heritage significance of the HCA and its contributory items, all applications for development within the HCA should be assessed with regard to the impact of the proposed development on individual buildings, the character of the overall area and its heritage significance.

- Council DCP requires the preparation of a Heritage Impact Statement to accompany Development Applications for major works such as demolition, partial demolition, major alterations and additions, or new or replacement development within the HCA.
- Council LEP be amended to require that applications for demolition of a building in the HCA should only be considered in conjunction with a development application for proposed replacement development. This practice is increasing in urban conservation areas, an example being Willoughby Council.
- Investigate potential heritage items' significance to establish if listing is warranted in the LEP.

6.4 Development Guidelines and Controls

The HCA's character and heritage values are derived from a combination of elements, ranging from building form, materials and details to landscaping. This section explains how the careful control of changes to these elements through proactive planning policies can safeguard the HCA's character and appearance.

6.4.1 Streetscape

Aim

- To retain the low density residential character established by the mix of dwelling styles and sizes found in the HCA, ranging from substantial Late Victorian and Federation homes to more modest Inter-War dwellings on separate lots, with surrounding garden space.
- To conserve evidence of the HCA's subdivision pattern evolution from the late-nineteenthcentury and early-twentieth-century grand estates, to the generous cottage developments of the pre-World War I and interwar years.
- To conserve significant built evidence of the development of the HCA during the Federation and interwar periods.
- To conserve significant natural and cultural landscape features.

Keep

- All buildings and landscape features recognised as contributing to the significance of the HCA.
- The existing street pattern, including streets and laneways without widening.
- The predominant pattern of subdivision comprising lots of sufficient width and depth to accommodate a single detached dwelling set back from the street, and side and rear boundaries. There should be sufficient space at the front for ornamental gardens and trees, and sufficient space at the rear for suitable outdoor living and play, utility areas and trees.

- Buildings should complement the predominating setbacks in the street.
- Building setbacks from side boundaries suitable for a single landscaped driveway on one side (usually a minimum of 3.5m, preferably 4m) and access and planting on the other (minimum of 1m).

Avoid

- The subdivision of large allotments that would result in houses sited in gardens that are too small in proportion to the size of the houses, or the positioning of houses where they would disrupt characteristic patterns of development.
- Re-subdividing allotments into narrower allotments that alter the subdivision pattern and require an additional driveway crossing. In particular, the remaining large holdings (such as Landskrona) and remnants of historic estates (such as The Highlands) should not be further subdivided, to the detriment of their character, identity and significance. New lots should not be permitted to create the potential for new dwellings that would adversely impact upon the existing heritage items or contributory items. For example, new houses should not be built in front of heritage items.
- Amalgamating allotments unless the resulting development is of a form that reflects the established character of single detached dwellings on separate allotments.
- Extensive cut and fill or retaining walls that would visually disrupt the natural landform or streetscape character.

6.4.2 Existing Buildings (Alterations and Additions)

Aim

- To site and control alterations and additions to existing buildings in order to retain the intactness and consistency of the streetscape and retain elements that contribute to the significance of the HCA.
- To ensure that alterations and additions to existing buildings do not adversely affect significant characteristics of the streetscape.
- To ensure that alterations and additions to buildings that contribute to the significance of the HCA (ie heritage items and contributory items) respect the contributory and/or streetscape value of these buildings.
- To encourage the removal of unsympathetic alterations to existing buildings.

Keep

• The consistent setback of existing buildings from the streets in gardens uncluttered by buildings, carports or other structures.

Encourage

- The scale (height and size) of additions to be smaller than that of the existing building.
- The form (massing and building arrangement) of additions to complement and not compete with the existing building. Additions shall generally match the roof pitch, form and proportions of the existing building. Skillion or 'lean-to' additions may be appropriate at the rear of significant buildings, as this is a traditional form of building extension.
- The character (overall design treatment or 'style') of additions to significant buildings to be complementary to their design. It should be possible to tell the new from the old on close inspection. Where the addition is not visible from the street, its style becomes less important and there is greater flexibility in design. For example, a contemporary design may be appropriate for a new detached pavilion addition at the rear of an existing house.
- Retain building alignments at the rear, similar to the alignment of the adjacent buildings and the
 prevailing development pattern. Extensions or new development shall only project into rear
 yards beyond the alignment of neighbouring buildings, provided that there is space to retain
 mature trees and for new tree planting and to provide for side and rear setbacks that retain the
 characteristic of gardens adjacent to neighbouring gardens.

Avoid

- Additions to the front or side of an existing building.
- Alterations that are greater in scale than the existing building or neighbouring buildings.
- Altering the existing roof form on heritage items and contributory buildings.
- Extending a house in a style that detracts from the streetscape value of the building.
- Altering a heritage item or contributory building to restyle its appearance.

6.4.3 New Building or Replacement Development

Aim

• To ensure that a new building or replacement development, including development in the vicinity of the HCA, respects and conserves the significance and positive characteristics of the HCA.

- To ensure that new development satisfies 'infill' principles; ie is appropriate to its context in terms of scale, massing, character, orientation, siting, setback, materials and detailing.
- To ensure that new development retains an appropriate visual setting for heritage items and contributory buildings in the conservation area (consistent with Article 8 of the Burra Charter).

Keep

- The predominant height and scale of the buildings in the HCA (single storey, two storey, and part single/part two storey buildings, with generous surrounding garden space).
- The established development pattern, including similar allotment size and shape, setbacks and spaces between buildings.
- Proportions of building footprint to garden space similar to the typical pattern.
- The pattern of front gardens adjacent to front gardens, house adjacent to house and rear gardens adjacent to rear gardens. To maintain this pattern and amenity, new development shall only project into rear yards, beyond the alignment of neighbouring buildings, provided that there is space to retain mature trees and for new tree planting and to provide for side and rear setbacks that retain the characteristic of gardens adjacent to neighbouring gardens.

Encourage

- New buildings to respect the prevailing development pattern and reflect the footprint of contributory buildings on adjacent properties.
- New buildings to relate the predominant scale of those surrounding. Where adjacent buildings
 are single-storey, buildings should be single-storey. Alternatively, a single-storey form with a
 two-storey element at the rear or an attic roof form may be appropriate, provided that the roof
 pitch is not markedly higher than that of the existing building or neighbouring heritage items and
 contributory buildings.
- Building form and character to complement the form and character of neighbouring heritage items or contributory buildings. New buildings should be well articulated or broken up on the street frontage and employ roof forms sympathetic to those characteristically found in the streetscape. Roofs should be of a form and pitch that relate to contributory buildings nearby.
- Garaging and small utility structures should be set at the rear of houses.
- Development of properties with frontages on two streets should respect the predominant pattern
 of front yards facing one street and rear yards facing the other. High fencing may be permitted
 on the rear or side yard frontage, provided that it is of a traditional type, eg 1.8m timber paling or
 lapped and capped fence.

Avoid

- Buildings that stand forward of adjacent buildings in the streetscape or project into rear yards beyond the alignment of existing buildings.
- Buildings that poorly mimic existing Federation or Inter-War buildings in character and details. Contemporary interpretation of traditional characteristics and details is more appropriate and successful in design terms. It is important that the scale, form and character of the new building enhances, and does not compete with or detract from the Federation and Inter-War characteristics of the HCA.
- Buildings that stand out in the streetscape in marked contrast to contributory buildings due to their unsympathetic siting, scale, form or architectural character, including materials, details and colours.
- Buildings that disrupt the rhythm of similarly-scaled buildings in the streetscape.
- Building heights that compete with the tree canopy for visual prominence.
- Buildings that extend across the entire width of blocks, contrary to the existing pattern of development.
- Buildings or garages that extend across the entire width of blocks, contrary to the existing pattern of development.
- New development in the vicinity of the HCA that is of a scale, form or character that diminishes the significance of the HCA or detracts from the significant characteristics contained within it, including contributory buildings and their settings.

6.4.4 Appropriate Housing and Development Forms

- The scope for further subdivision for new housing development is generally limited in this HCA. The main housing development opportunity would be the replacement of existing houses that are recognised as not contributing to the significance of the HCA. Infill design considerations should lead the planning and design of these developments.
- The conversion of a single detached dwelling to accommodate two dwellings may be considered by Council. This is intended to encourage the retention and restoration of larger houses that contribute to the heritage value of the HCA in more intensive residential use. Such conversion/partial demolition and any additions must be sympathetic to the heritage value of the building as well as to the streetscape. There should be no additional driveways. Any additional car parking should be consistent with these guidelines.
- Dwelling conversions should preferably not be strata titled, unless this is the only means of ensuring their conservation. In any event, it should not result in the two parts of the building

having a different appearance owing to a lack of co-ordination of changes in cladding or colours, and different types of landscaping.

 The most appropriate housing form for this area is the single detached dwelling house. Some limited potential might exist for dual occupancy or smaller multiple occupancy dwellings, designed to conform to the characteristics of the Conservation Area and to respect its heritage values, but the impact of such development upon the amenity of the significant buildings in the area may be in conflict with conservation objectives, reinforcing the stated preference for single family dwellings consistent with the area's character.

6.4.5 Garages, Carports and Outbuildings

Aim

- To ensure that new garages, carports and other structures are sited and designed to respect the established development pattern of the area.
- To retain an appropriate setting for heritage items, contributory buildings and the streetscape.

Keep

- Garages separately articulated from the rest of the building.
- Driveways and driveway crossings to a single car width with a minimum of hard-surfacing.

Encourage

- The siting of garages and carports only where they can be located behind the main building line, preferably in the rear yard.
- Sheds and other outbuildings/structures to be located in rear yards.
- Driveways and access handles to battleaxe blocks to be of sufficient width to provide for landscaping at either side to minimise the impact of paving (the Dwelling House DCP states that driveways should have a minimum width of 3m with a landscape verge of 0.5m on each side; and battleaxe blocks should have an access handle width of at least 3.5m). Paving preferably to be the traditional two strips with turf between, rather than full-width paving. At least one metre landscape verge is necessary to support hedges or screen planting.
- Garages to be of a scale, form and character that is comparable with traditional garage forms (examples are shown in diagram form in the 'Siting' section of the Heritage Development Control Plan), especially where they are visible from the street.

Avoid

- Garages, carports or other structures in front gardens or projecting forward of the building line.
- More than one driveway crossing per property.
- Garages/carports built into the street facade of the house.
- Double garages, other than at the rear of the block or otherwise screened from view.

6.4.6 Details and Materials

Aim

- To retain details and materials that contribute to the significance of the area.
- To ensure that new details, materials and colours are compatible with significant buildings and landscape elements.
- To encourage the restoration and reconstruction of missing detailed elements on contributory buildings.

Keep

 Original building fabric, details and materials that are components of significant buildings or landscape elements.

Encourage

- Roofs to be of traditional materials, such as terracotta Marseilles pattern tiles, that relate to roofs
 of contributory buildings.
- New dormer windows, if required for attic rooms, to be located at the rear of buildings as dormer windows are generally uncharacteristic of contributory buildings.
- Use of traditional colour schemes that relate to the traditional colours of contributory buildings.

Existing Buildings

- Alterations to contributory buildings, where visible from the street, to use materials and detailing that generally match the original as closely as possible, but are discernible on close inspection.
- Additions that respect the streetscape and the character of the existing house.

New Buildings

• New buildings whose materials and details respect the scale and proportions of these in contributory buildings. For example, Federation and Inter-War buildings are predominantly brick,

with a relatively small openings. Windows are generally vertically proportioned or broken up into vertically proportioned components. Modern dwellings with large, horizontally proportioned openings may be obtrusive.

 The use of materials, details and colours that refer to neighbouring significant buildings, without directly copying them. Exposed brickwork to be used in preference to rendered and painted walls, as most significant buildings have exposed brick walls, and the new buildings will harmonise more with the existing streetscape.

Avoid

- New openings on the facades of contributory buildings.
- Removing original details from the front or visible side facades of heritage items or contributory items.
- Changing existing roofs of contributory buildings, especially the main roof, unless it has been unsympathetically altered.
- Rendering and painting existing face brick walls.
- Applying unsympathetic ornamentation to heritage items or contributory buildings, such as castiron lace to Federation or Inter-War-period buildings.
- Mottled, specked or light-coloured brickwork.
- Highly-patterned or brightly-coloured paving. Paving should be unobtrusive.
- Colours that stand out in the streetscape, in marked contrast to the traditional colours of contributory buildings.

6.4.7 Fences and Garden Walls

Aim

• To retain and enhance landscape elements that contribute to the significance of the HCA.

Keep

• Original boundary treatments and restore or reconstruct them where necessary.

Encourage

 New front fences or walls to be of traditional low height (in some areas as low as 750mm, but mostly 900mm to 1200mm) and be compatible with characteristic forms. Solid privacy walls or high front fences shall not be permitted in the HCA.

- Side fences to be of traditional wooden paling or lapped-and-capped timber, lower in height at the front garden to match the height of the front fence.
- New or replacement boundary treatments for properties containing significant buildings to be sympathetic to the period to which the building relates.

Avoid

• New or replacement boundary treatments that are not a significant characteristic of the HCA, such as metal railings and brick pillars.

6.4.8 Gardens

Aim

- To safeguard gardens as a significant characteristic of the HCA with the retention of garden space at the front, side and rear of properties.
- To retain traditional gardens or planting layouts where they exist. Garden layouts and plantings
 are commonly complementary to the houses they surround; these should be carefully analysed
 and retained with careful attention to those species not now in popular taste, but prominent in the
 gardens of the Conservation Area. In particular, mature native and exotic trees which contribute
 to the leafy treed character of the area should be safeguarded.
- To retain garden elements and structures, paved surfaces and other structures that date from the original design and construction period of the house they serve; pathways and driveway surfaces come into this category, and as they can impact strongly upon the presentation and amenity of houses and streetscapes, new work should be carefully informed by the older surviving examples.

Keep

- Existing mature trees, subject to Council's tree preservation order.
- Mature eucalypts planted last century unless planted after the house was built and are now poorly sited.
- Garden layouts and plantings if they relate to the period to which the house belongs.
- Gardens large enough to include medium-sized to large-sized trees in front and rear yards.

Replace

• Mature trees that are removed with a tree in a similar or more appropriate location that will mature to similar size and canopy.

Avoid

- Using front gardens for car parking, paving or swimming pools.
- New development (including swimming pools and tennis courts) located within an appropriate distance from the root zone and the trunk of a forest (remnant) eucalypt or other significant mature tree unless an arborist specifically advises that the development would not affect the viability of the tree and is retained throughout construction to monitor its protection.
- New development placed under the canopy of mature eucalypts planted last century, unless with the advice of an arborist.
- Demolishing existing buildings or removing significant landscape features for the purpose of introducing tennis courts or swimming pools, particularly where this would affect the established development pattern.

6.4.9 Public Domain

Aim

- To retain and enhance significant features of the public domain.
- To ensure that new work within the public domain (such as that undertaken by Council) respects the significance of the HCA.
- To interpret the heritage significance of the HCA via continuation of Council's ongoing heritage plaque programme.

Keep

- All existing streetscape or building elements that contribute to the character of the HCA, such as kerbs and grass verges.
- Existing tree planting and canopy shall be retained and gaps should be filled where street trees are missing.
- Interpretative focus on The Highlands and its history.

Avoid

- Introducing streetscape or building elements that are unsympathetic to the character of the HCA.
- Obtrusive traffic-calming devices, such as roundabouts, which would disrupt the streetscape pattern.
- Planting by residents on verges, unless in accordance with a *Street Tree Masterplan* to be prepared by Council.

Godden Mackay Logan

Opportunities and Threats

7.1 Introduction

7.0

A number of Opportunities and Threats, in relation to the heritage management of the potential Heritage Conservation Area, have been identified in relation to the Wahroonga (North) area.

7.2 **Opportunities**

7.2.1 Hornsby Shire Council Heritage Officer: Good Advice

Hornsby Shire Council has employed a Heritage Officer since 1991. The Heritage Officer advises Council on issues relating to heritage including the establishment and management of Conservation Areas, such as that proposed for Wahroonga (North). The presence of a Heritage Officer at Council continues to be a positive opportunity for encouraging and supporting best practice heritage management in the Wahroonga (North) Heritage Conservation Area.

7.2.2 Hornsby Shire Council Local Heritage Assistance Fund: Financial Support

The Hornsby Shire Council currently allocates \$40,000 per year to its Local Heritage Assistance Fund. Private owners of listed heritage items can apply for dollar for dollar funding under the fund to assist them conserve and maintain their heritage assets. The fund continues to be a key factor in encouraging heritage conservation in the area.

Opportunities for extending funds to contributory places in conservation areas could be considered.

7.2.3 Strong Community Support for Heritage

Through the course of the project, it has become clear that there is strong community interest in the heritage values of the area and concern over the perceived threats to the area from possible overdevelopment. Two community consultation sessions have been held during the preparation of this study. The first, on 2 December 2004, was attended by over forty residents of the potential HCA, with a number of respondents to the questionnaire distributed on the night (see Appendix C). The second community consultation was held on 12 April 2005 where again approximately forty residents attended, some of whom had not attended the December meeting. Council invited all owners within the area to attend the presentations. Copies of the PowerPoint presentations (Appendix E) were available and a comments form was distributed.

Resident responses to the presentations on both nights and the return of questionnaires indicated a high level of community interest in the process, its outcomes and the impact any HCA would have on development in the area. The opinion of the residents varied from being strongly in favour of the HCA to advocating no extra protection. However, as the initial impetus for the creation of a HCA came from a petition to Council from the residents (of which 128 signed), it would suggest a high level of community support for the potential HCA.

The level of community support for the conservation of the area's heritage values will assist Council management initiatives.

7.3 Threats

7.3.1 State Environmental Planning Policy—Seniors Living 2004 Development

SEPP Seniors Living 2004 (like the former SEPP 5, which it replaces) can have an appreciable impact on the significance of HCAs. The bulk, density and scale of seniors developments can, if inappropriately designed, adversely impact on the character of established conservation areas. The implications of the SEPP Seniors Living 2004 on the potential HCA are addressed in Section 8.4 of this report.

7.3.2 New Oversized Faux-Heritage Development

The potential Conservation Area has a number of building styles, with many allotments still featuring generous garden settings. On the eastern edge of the area, around Woonona Avenue, Bareena Avenue and Benson Close, a number of new, large faux-heritage mansions have been constructed. A common feature of these type of dwellings is their large footprint on the allotment, leaving little space for gardens or yards, and the application of false Federation detailing. The continued intrusion of these types of dwellings within the study area could undermine the established characteristics of the area.

In addition, a number of newer dwellings have garage or car parking space provided at the front of the residence. The siting of garages prominently at the front of new dwellings is inconsistent with the older, dominant form of dwelling with the garage set back from the street frontage at the rear or to the side of the houses. If garages are to be included in the new homes, they should be located to the rear, not in the front of the dwellings.

7.3.3 Subdivision of Large Allotments

A number of oversize allotments along Bundarra Avenue and Woonona Avenue will require close monitoring should subdivision or amalgamation be mooted. Since most are listed heritage items in the LEP, the provision of a conservation management plan, which carefully assesses curtilage and design issues, will assist decision making.

Re-subdividing allotments into narrower allotments that alter the subdivision pattern and require an additional driveway crossing should be avoided. In particular, the remaining large holdings (such as Landskrona) and remnants of historic estates (such as The Highlands) should not be further subdivided, to the detriment of their character, identity and significance. New lots should not be permitted to create the potential for new dwellings that would adversely impact upon the existing heritage items or contributory items. For example, new houses should not be built in front of heritage items.

Planning Policy Review

8.1 Hornsby Shire Local Environmental Plan 1994

8.0

The Conservation Area, with the exception of the Waitara Public School land, is zoned as 'Residential A' low density. The implications of this zoning on the area's conservation are as follows:

- development consent is not required for home occupations and special care homes (and exempt development);
- development consent is required for uses other than home occupation, special care homes and subdivision;
- in terms of density, the minimum area set for allotment size is 500 square metres. However, it is
 stated that the Council may consent to the development of land for the purpose of multi-unit
 housing if the resulting density is not greater than one dwelling per 350 square metres; and
- in terms of floorspace ratio, development should not result in a building that exceeds a floorspace ratio of 0.4:1.

The implications of the 'Residential A' zoning for the Wahroonga (North) Conservation Area (with the exception of the Waitara Public School land) in respect of set limits on density levels and floorspace ratio is considered adequate to maintain the existing character of the area. The area is primarily made up of detached properties in generous garden settings and the current LEP zoning accommodates this pattern of development.

The Waitara Public School land is zoned as Special Uses A (Community Purposes), which means that development consent is not required on its site for non-school uses like special care homes (and consent is never needed for exempt development as per the EPA Act). This zoning provides for a range of community uses with the benefit of development consent including the existing use, which is educational establishments. It is assumed that the existing school is well established in this locality and will remain in operation in the long-term. As such, the school's zoning raises no concerns in respect of undesirable impacts on the Conservation Area's character and appearance.

The 'Heritage' section of the LEP 1994 (Policy 18) lays out the Council's role and responsibilities in respect of handling development applications affecting heritage items, heritage conservation areas, archaeological sites and potential archaeological sites. Of particular note is the requirement within part (6) of the policy, to submit a conservation plan along with a development application when a proposal would impact on a heritage item of regional, state or national significance. Within the Wahroonga (North) Conservation Area, a number of heritage items have plots greater than 500 square metres. It is recommended that the Conservation Management Plans required for development on these items, or heritage assessments for places within the HCA, address any proposed subdivision that may adversely impact the heritage significance of the item or HCA.

8.2 Hornsby Shire Heritage Development Control Plan

The Heritage DCP has been in operation since 18 April 1995 (reviewed March 2003). The management policies identified in this study (see Section 6.0) identify improvements to be made to the Hornsby Shire Heritage DCP to cover omissions and strengthen the Council's heritage policy position. Recommendations are detailed below:

- The 'Design' section primarily sets out design considerations to be taken into account when additions or alterations to existing properties are being proposed. Other sections in the Heritage DCP, 'siting' and 'streetscape' in particular, touch on issues to be taken into account in new development as opposed to additions/alterations. However, it is considered that there is little specific advice in respect of achieving sensitive contextual design. As such, it is recommended that a separate section on contextual architecture in conservation areas, to explicitly guide new buildings or replacement development, should be added which incorporates the matters identified in Section 6.0 of this report.
- The DCP makes no particular reference to the issue of dwelling conversions to dual occupancy and its potential impact on the character of the area. This matter is dealt with in the 'Appropriate Housing and Development Forms' section within Section 6.4.4 of this report and it is recommended that this be added to this DCP.
- Addition of a section specifically dealing with garages, carports and outbuildings which incorporates the guidelines recommended in the previous section.
- Addition of a section specifically dealing with building details and materials should be added which incorporates the guidelines recommended in Section 6.0.
- In our assessment of the Conservation Area, there were no instances where a garage or carport sited at the front of the property would not cause harm to the character and appearance of the streetscape. As such, it is recommended that the siting section be amended to communicate that it is unlikely that the positioning of garages, carports and hardstandings for cars at the front of properties would be given development approval. This would require the deletion of points 3 and 4 under Siting.
- The 'Streetscape' section mentions in the context of driveways that, 'Large areas of concrete should be avoided where possible. Alternative materials such as pavers, gravel or grass-crete should be explored'. Study fieldwork identified large swaths of hardsurfacing taking up the majority of front garden areas. Accordingly, it is recommended that both the 'streetscape' and 'landscape' sections of the DCP be amplified to avoid the damaging impact of green garden space being taken over by hardsurfacing, irrespective of surface material, on the character and appearance of the area.

• Within the 'Landscaping' section it is stated that, 'Where the property size allows for the sympathetic introduction of a tennis court or pool, its design and materials should be discreet and unobtrusive. It is usually more appropriate for these features to be located at the rear of the property, where they are not visible from the street'. It is recommended that this statement be strengthened, as per the previous section, to state that the demolition of existing buildings or removal of significant landscape features for the purposes of introducing tennis courts or swimming pools, particularly where this would disrupt the established development pattern, would not be supported.

8.3 Hornsby Shire Dwelling House Development Control Plan

The Dwelling House DCP applies to the zoning identified for the Wahroonga (North) Conservation Area, Residential A, amongst others. There is some necessary duplication of information found in the Heritage DCP contained within the Dwelling House DCP. Overlap areas include scale, setbacks, design, height, landscaping, vehicle access and parking, fencing and heritage. The controls contained within this document would generally allow for the proper protection of an area such as the Wahroonga (North) Conservation Area. Useful advice is offered in particular on setbacks and the positioning of garages and carports in relation to properties:

- Within the 'Setbacks' section it is stated, 'Front setbacks should be consistent with adjacent development and complement the streetscape ... In many areas in the Shire, a setback of 7.6m (25 feet) or greater exist and it may be necessary to conform to this setback to maintain the streetscape character.'
- Within 'Vehicle Access and Parking' three useful diagrams show the most appropriate location for garages and carports, namely at the rear with access from a rear lane, at the side of the house well setback and at the rear with access from the front. (This is consistent with the information contained within the Heritage Development Control Plan.)

However, the following amendment is recommended:

It is stated within the 'Setbacks' section that, 'Low scale, single storey development may be permitted to encroach within the setback area where it provides a transition in height between two storey dwelling-houses and the street and where it complements the streetscape'. Provision is also made for an encroachment if it enables the preservation of mature vegetation. Reference is also made to this issue within the 'Height' section. It is recommended that a sentence be added to these sections to the effect that such an encroachment is unlikely to be acceptable within a Heritage Conservation Area.

8.4 State Environmental Planning Policy—Seniors Living 2004

State Environmental Planning Policy (SEPP)—Seniors Living 2004 is of particular relevance to the Wahroonga (North) Conservation Area. The present low density zoning of the area and its location close to good transport links, primarily the Waitara Railway Station, means that it would be an attractive location for developers of seniors living accommodation. There are two main concerns about this form of development:

- Plot amalgamation is necessary to create the prescribed development sites as set out in this SEPP. For instance, in order to provide 'Self-care housing as in-fill in low density zones', a minimum site area is set at 1000 square metres with a minimum site frontage at the building line of 20m. A development of this kind within the Wahroonga (North) Heritage Conservation Area would create lot sites that would be out of keeping with the established pattern of development and as such, would negatively impact on its character and significance.
- The built form that would result from that prescribed in this SEPP could often be out of character and inappropriate in respect of its surrounding context. For instance, in 'Self-care housing built on urban fringes', sites must accommodate at least seventy dwellings. In an area such as the Wahroonga (North) Conservation Area, with the majority of properties comprising detached dwellings within generous grounds, intensive development on amalgamated sites would erode the identified character of the area.

It is worth noting, however, that there are several sections of this policy document which make particular reference to heritage conservation areas and items, as well as the need for good design. The main sections of note are as follows:

- within Part 4 ('*Land to which Policy applies*'), paragraph (2) (e), it is stated that the policy does not apply to '*land to which a listing on the State Heritage Register kept under the Heritage Act 1977 applies*';
- within Part 5 (*'Relationship to other environmental planning instruments'*), paragraph (4), it is stated that *'This Policy does not affect a provision in another environmental planning instrument that relates to the demolition of a heritage item*';
- within Part 31 ('Neighbourhood amenity and streetscape'), paragraph (b) of Division 2 'Design Principles', it is stated that proposed development should 'retain, complement and sensitively harmonise with any heritage conservation areas in the vicinity and any relevant heritage items so that new buildings contribute to the quality and identity of the area'. Within paragraph (c) of this same Part, it is also stated that there is a need to 'maintain reasonable neighbourhood amenity and appropriate residential character by:
 - (i) providing building setbacks to reduce bulk and overshadowing, and
 - (ii) using building form and siting that relates to the site's land form, and

(iii) adopting building heights at the street frontage that are compatible in scale with adjacent development...';

- strength is given to the design requirements set out in Division 2 of the SEPP through Part 78
 (*Inter-relationship of Part with design principles in Part 3*) which states that development
 consent can be withheld from applicants who fail to demonstrate that adequate regard has been
 given to the specified design requirements irrespective of other requirements being fulfilled; and
- it is recommended that Council fully utilise these sections of the policy in their determination of seniors living accommodation development applications within the Wahroonga (North) Conservation Area, should they occur.

8.4.1 Hornsby Council Housing Strategy

It is noted that in March 2003 Council forwarded a Strategy to DIPNR for exemption from SEPP No. 5, now Seniors Living. No formal response has been received from DIPNR at this time.

8.4.2 26-28 Myra Street

In August 2004 a Development Application was lodged with Council for a Seniors Living development, comprising ten dwellings, car parking and accompanying landscaping. The development proposed the demolition of four dwellings including 24–26 Myra Street. As part of the Council's Stage 3 Heritage Review, the property was investigated by Tropman and Tropman which recommended listing the site as a heritage item on a local level. An Interim Heritage Order was sought by Council in October 2004. Council received advice from the NSW Heritage Office to advise that it would not be recommending the Minister to issue an IHO, given that the property is unlikely to meet the threshold of State Significance and the current investigation of the property for local listing.

The property and proposed Seniors Living development is, at the time of writing, still the subject of a Land and Environment Court case. If the development proceeds it will be the first such development within the potential conservation area boundary, and will remove a major contributory house and garden ensemble.

Godden Mackay Logan

Recommendations

A number of recommendations concerning the ongoing management of the study area are set out below for Council.

9.1 Adopt Wahroonga (North) Heritage Conservation Area as a Conservation Area in the LEP

This will enable Council to manage the area in concert with other HCAs in the Shire, in full recognition of its significance. No changes to its boundary are recommended. The statement of significance should be included in the Heritage DCP.

The adoption of the area as a HCA will establish and support the critical area-focus of management which will assist Council and residents/applicants to deal with the Area's significance. Generic controls expressed in terms to cover a whole Municipality do not generally work as well as area-specific controls, with all the answers in one place.

9.2 Adopt Heritage Council Infill Guidelines

9.0

The Heritage Council of NSW and the Royal Institute of Architects, New South Wales, have recently redrafted guidelines for Infill Development as part of the New South Wales Government's promotion of high quality design of new buildings. The guidelines are designed to inform design within the context of the place it is set down for and to respond to that context. The guidelines have been set out in categories and explained as case studies, to make for easier implementation. The guidelines set out principles for character, scale, form, siting, materials, colour and detailing.

It is recommended that Council adopt these guidelines in respect of all its Heritage Conservation Areas.

9.3 Interpret the Significance of the Heritage Conservation Area

Hornsby Shire Council has already implemented an interpretation strategy for other conservation areas within the Shire boundary. The nearby Wahroonga Heritage Conservation Area (centred around Isis Street) includes a plaque affixed to a boulder in the street, which gives a brief explanation of the history and heritage of the conservation area. It is recommended that a similar interpretative strategy be implemented for the Wahroonga (North) HCA.

Council may consider developing distinctive street signs for the conservation area, a modest means of identifying the special nature of the area.

A number of local residents have lived in the area many years and have acquired local historical information (such as wartime use) which should be recorded for Council's local history collection. It is recommended that an oral history collection about the area be initiated.

The study area provides excellent opportunities for Human Society and Its Environment (HSIE) and history students (Twentieth Century Unit) field study units. Work with local schools to develop.

9.4 Changes to the Heritage DCP

It is recommended that changes be made to the Hornsby Shire Heritage DCP, as set out in Section 8.0 of this report to apply to the Wahroonga (North) HCA.

9.5 Review of Existing Heritage Items

A number of the heritage Items listed are identified as gardens only. It is recommended that the seven Heritage Items identified as gardens only within the potential HCA boundary should be reexamined to determine whether their current listing should also include the buildings or dwellings on the block.

10.0

Appendices

Appendix A

Godden Mackay Logan PowerPoint Presentation for Community Consultation, 2 December 2004

Appendix B

Hornsby Shire Council PowerPoint Presentation for Community Consultation, 2 December 2004

Appendix C

Summary Outcomes of the Community Consultation, 2 December 2004

Appendix D

Wahroonga (North) Heritage Conservation Area Assessment, December 2004—Comments and Feedback Form

Appendix E

Godden Mackay Logan PowerPoint Presentation for Community Consultation, 12 April 2005

Appendix F

Summary Outcomes of the Community Consultation, 12 April 2005

Godden Mackay Logan

Appendix A

Godden Mackay Logan PowerPoint Presentation for Community Consultation, 2 December 2004
Heritage Consultants

Wahroonga (North) Heritage Conservation Area Assessment

Public Consultation Stage 1 2 December 2004

Heritage Consultants

Conservation Area Management Issues

- Conservation areas possess historic and usually also aesthetic values.
- Conservation areas have particular heritage values that distinguish them from their surroundings.
- Conservation areas are more than a collection of individual heritage items.
- Conservation areas have historical origins and relationships between elements that create a sense of place that is worth keeping.

Heritage Consultants



Gulgong-gold mining town-conservation area

Heritage Consultants



Newcastle-a streetscape of variety and unity

Heritage Consultants



Artarmon Conservation Area-suburban street pattern



Heritage Consultants

Fine grain streetscape elements are important

Heritage Consultants



Public Domain-urban furniture, parks and gardensthe Balmoral Beach Conservation Area

Heritage Consultants



Mt Wilson Conservation Area-street trees and gardens

Heritage Consultants

Conservation Area Management Issues

 Not all buildings will be of equal value to the conservation area

Heritage Consultants



Heritage Consultants



Heritage Consultants

Conservation Area Management Issues

 Buildings and elements that contribute to the heritage value of a conservation area need to be retained and respected

Heritage Consultants



Pressures for fashion

Heritage Consultants



Pressures for extension

Heritage Consultants



Pressures for car accommodation

Heritage Consultants



Pressures for re-development

Heritage Consultants

Wahroonga (North) Heritage Conservation Area Assessment

Study Brief:

- Is it a conservation area?
- What is its significance?
- What is its character?
- How should it be conserved?

Heritage Consultants

Heritage Planning: Hornsby Shire

- To ensure that the specific heritage qualities and character of Hornsby Shire are maintained, Hornsby Council has:
- Included heritage provisions in the LEP (1994) which lists 800 items;
- Produced a Development Control Plan to guide and assist property owners;
- Established a Local Heritage Assistance Fund;
- Collected local history resources and reference material in the Local Studies library;
- Employed a heritage officer, in-house; and
- Undertaken an ongoing program of revision of heritage items and conservation areas (of which this is part).

Heritage Consultants

The Wahroonga (North) Heritage Conservation area assessment study tasks include:

- Research the history of the area and analyse its themes of development;
- Undertake detailed fieldwork to identify contributory elements, buildings and places and the significant characteristics of the area;
- Formulate a statement of significance;
- Consult with residents for input and feedback; and
- Recommend planning and management strategies.

Heritage Consultants



The Study Area

Heritage Consultants

Historical Overview Aboriginal Occupation

- Aboriginal settlement in the Hornsby area dating back 15-20,000 years
- Settlement areas extending from the plateau areas to the Hawkesbury River
- Contact between Aborigines and Europeans in the Hornsby area from as early as 1794.
- By 1820s, the Aboriginal population has been severely dislocated, with the majority of the people having either left or been forced from the area.

Heritage Consultants

Early European Settlement

- Convict and Government timber gangs are operating in the region from the c1820s
- Private timber merchants follow during the 1830s, notably Thomas Hyndes and Aaron Pearce
- Orchards followed as the timber resource was removed. Dominated the landscape from mid 1800s to 1880s



1893 Map showing land holders

Heritage Consultants

The Railway

- The railway for the North Shore was first proposed in 1875
- First surveys during 1879-1880 from Pearces Corner to the harbour
- 1883 the line was re-surveyed and work began in 1887
- The railway opened from Pearces Corner to St Leonards in January 1890, and onto Milsons Point in 1893

Heritage Consultants

The Estates

- The railway allowed for and encouraged greater settlement of the Wahroonga area
- City elite began to purchase large estates close to the proposed line for the construction of grand houses
- Earliest example is The Highlands, built in 1892/3 for Alfred Hordern and his wife Caroline. Architect designed by John Horbury Hunt. The Highlands Estate covered almost half of the study area
- Bundarra Estate dominates the remaining eastern portion of the study area. Bundarra homestead was removed for the Newcastle Freeway
- Other large houses include Neringla (Woonona Ave)

Heritage Consultants



The Highlands, built 1892/3. Designed by John Horbury Hunt, the estate dominated the Wahroonga area for 40 years

Heritage Consultants

Subdivision

- The access provided by the railway put pressure on the estates to subdivide
- First sales advertised in early 1890s. Bundarra Estates' first subdivision in October 1892, but mainly focuses to the south of the railway line, between railway and Lane Cove Road (Pacific Highway)
- Subdivision continues in the study area until the 1950s



Bundarra Estate October 1892

Heritage Consultants



Bundarra Estate December 1893



Bundarra Estate 1899

Heritage Consultants

The Highlands Estate and later subdivision

- The Highlands Estate remained substantially intact until 1933. Part of the estate had been sold in 1923 for an Infants School and more in 1933 for the Primary School
- 1932 Alfred Horden died, in 1933 the first 18 lots were offered for sale fronting Myra Street, Edgeworth David Road, Bundarra Avenue and Alexandria Parade.
- Later sales reduced the estate to its present size, while also creating the streets, Highlands Avenue, Fern Avenue and Oleander Road

Heritage Consultants



1930 aerial photograph showing the study area

Heritage Consultants



1938 Subdivision sale of part of The Highlands Estate

Heritage Consultants



Water Board plan of Bundarra Ave and Ingalara Ave in 1937 (subdivided 1926)

Heritage Consultants

Inter-war and post war development

- The subdivision of The Highlands estate in the 1930s provided many new lots for development
- Many significant houses of the inter-war period are present in the study area, including California Bungalows and Moderne Style
- 1940s and 1950s some Housing Commission development in the Wahroonga area. Remnants may remain in Lochville Street.
- Also some architect designed 'Project homes' on individual sites

Heritage Consultants



1955 aerial photograph showing the study area


June 1950 sale of the Neringla Estate. One of the last major estate sales in the Wahroonga area

Heritage Consultants

Newcastle-Sydney Freeway

- First proposed in 1948 following the course of the Spring Creek Gully, boundary between Hornsby and Kuring-gai Shires
- Property acquisition begins in the 1970s
- Construction of road bridges at Edgeworth David Avenue and Alexandria Street, and Railway Bridge started early 1980s
- Freeway opened in 1989
- The construction created the eastern boundary of the study area, and resulted in the demolition of a number of properties as well as the dislocation of local cross streets eg Bareena St and Lochville Ave

Heritage Consultants

Historic Themes

- Historic Themes provide a context within which heritage assessment criteria can be applied and help in evaluating comparative significance of an item or place
- Themes can be used as an alerting device to stimulate broad scale thinking about a place and its connections
- Thematic analysis is used to identify the relevant development and historical framework within which the significance of items and places can be assessed
- Thematic analysis provides a basis for undertaking fieldwork to test and query historic documentation

Heritage Consultants

Potential Historic Themes for Wahroonga (North)

- Aboriginal culture and interactions: Aboriginal settlement, sites and contact
- Agriculture and forestry: the orchardists and timber getters
- Transport: the railway and its influence
- Towns, suburbs and villages: the subdivision pattern and streetscape
- Accommodation: house styles
- Domestic life: the gardens
- Education: the Waitara Primary School

Heritage Consultants

Questions yet to answer

- What was the temporary army camp near Waitara Public School during the Second World War?
- Are there any Pettitt and Sevitt houses in the study area?
- What places have social values which our research to date may not have uncovered?
- Were there Housing Commission houses in the study area, eg around Lochville Ave?

Heritage Consultants

WAHROONGA (NORTH) HERITAGE CONSERVATION AREA

Preliminary Fieldwork Results Significant Characteristics

- The pattern of houses and blocks constitutes evidence of the gradually evolving subdivision pattern, extending from the estates of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, to the generous cottage subdivisions of the pre WW1 and interwar years, to the ever smaller - blocks (with increasingly larger houses) of the later twentieth century - which all together comprise the Area's development history until the present day.
- The predominant land use remains almost exclusively that of detached residences on single lots.
- There is a notable **variation in lot sizes and shapes**, derived of the early estate and street patterns, and the subdivision plans adopted.
- The Area still features generous garden settings, with private gardens to front and rear (sometimes also to the side), and widths generally sufficient to provide for landscaped setbacks, driveways to rear-sited garages, and high levels of privacy and amenity between dwellings – many gardens are listed as heritage items in their own right.

- Examples of substantial, largely intact and significant houses from the Late Victorian and Federation periods, encompassing the major architectural styles of those times with significant individual examples – the Late Victorian Aesthetic Movement mansion "Highlands", by J.Horbury Hunt; "Neringla" and "Cherrygarth", the noted Federation Queen Anne Revival mansions – along with some smaller homes of the same period, eg. small timber cottages such as No.2 Churchill Avenue.
- Examples of good, characteristic Inter-War period houses, in styles ranging across the Old English, Mediterranean and Californian Bungalow fashions (eg., 58 Woonona Avenue, and 26-28 Myra Street) with some early "Moderne" examples (eg., No.15 Ingalara Avenue) and a small group of Housing Commission style cottages in Lochville and Douglas Avenues.

- Examples of interesting, more modest mid and late twentieth century houses, some of them on smaller lots created by comparative late subdivisions (eg 2A Highlands Avenue).
- There are also numbers of **recently built houses** of larger scale on comparatively smaller blocks with less landscaped setting eg., new houses in Highlands Avenue and the northern part of Woonona Avenue. **Some of these are obtrusive in their context**, due to their scale, bulk, and site cover.

- While there is currently a comparatively small number of Heritage Items (in the area), there is a large number of properties that are contributory to the Study Area.
- There remain however, a significant number of non-contributory properties which offer important opportunities for appropriate contextual re-development within the Area.
- The Area does not include any significant public open space. The only public buildings are those in the Waitara Public School, whose grounds form the largest open landscaped space within the Study Area.

- Significant mature street tree plantings (such as those in Myra Street, Bundarra Avenue and Churchill Avenue) contribute to the marked bushland character and tree-covered amenity of the Area as a whole. These are complemented by the high number of tall native forest trees which have been retained within private gardens and back yards.
- There is a **wide variety of front fences**, many of which are low , and usually combined with hedge and screen plantings. Many of the more carefully designed and original houses are complemented by appropriately composed front fences, which with the plantings used, do not divorce houses from the street.
- Dividing fences are mostly timber framed with palings or wire, and are screened by garden plantings.
- Surviving **earlier garages** are not set forward of the homes they serve, but are set mainly behind the building line, or behind the house, making them less noticeable in streetscapes.
- Driveways and paved areas are generally secondary, in terms of area, to the soft landscaping in the street and front gardens of the older homes, whereas new houses tend to have large paved driveway aprons.

Heritage Consultants



The area retains a remarkable number of mature native trees, augmented by later street and private garden plantings

Heritage Consultants



Street trees and grassed nature strips and carefully managed front gardens create fine streetscapes

Heritage Consultants



Some small Edwardian period timber cottages survive, with remnant garden plantings

Heritage Consultants



Inter-war Mediterranean homes with carefully managed gardens add to the complexity of the streetscapes

Heritage Consultants



Some bungalows feature distinctive use of materials, such as this use of sandstone frontage

Heritage Consultants



A striking early Moderne style house at 15 Ingalara Avenue

Heritage Consultants



Substantial Moderne style houses

Heritage Consultants



Low stone walls combine with established garden plantings to create strong streetscapes

Heritage Consultants



Unusual bushstone pitched frontage wall-a softer retaining structure

Godden Mackay Logan Heritage Consultants

Large modern Federation revival homes are an increasing presence in the areas' streetscapes

Heritage Consultants



A new neo-Georgian new house in Woonona Avenue

Heritage Consultants



New homes often incorporate garages placed to the front of their house and with large unsympathetic doors and paved forecourts

Heritage Consultants



Complex, multiple garage installations do not complement existing streetscapes

Heritage Consultants



A side porte-cochere and rear sited garage attached to a fine Californian bungalow

Heritage Consultants



Side setbacks wide enough for driveways, combine with rear garages to maximise the apparent spaciousness of home settings



The Waitara Public School complex is the only group of public buildings within the area

Heritage Consultants



A monument to an early pupil of the school, inscribed with later additional dedications

Heritage Consultants

Typical Development Considerations in Conservation Areas

- subdivision pattern
- form, bulk and scale of new development or alteration
- details and materials
- fences and garden walls
- garages, carports and outbuildings
- landscaping palette
- the public domain

Heritage Consultants

Where to from here?

- Further historic research eg potential heritage items
- Definition of areas Heritage Significance
- Review of planning controls and pressures
- Identification of potential conservation/development constraints and opportunities
- Public consultation on draft recommendation
- Amendment and preparation of Study Report to Council

Heritage Consultants

Wahroonga (North) Heritage Conservation Area Assessment, December 2004

Your Feedback and Comments are Welcome

Your Details (optional):

- Name
- Postal Address
- Phone Number
- Email Address

Godden Mackay Logan Contacts

- Mark Dunn (Consultant) OR Sheridan Burke (Director)
- Godden Mackay Logan Pty Ltd
- 78 George Street
- Redfern NSW 2016
- Phone: 02 9319 4811 Fax: 02 9319 4383
- Email: <u>heritage@gml.com.au</u>
- Website: www.gml.com.au

Appendix B

Hornsby Shire Council PowerPoint Presentation for Community Consultation, 2 December 2004



Wahroonga (North) Heritage Study

Community Information Meeting

2 December 2004





Meeting Purpose

- Provide a background to the Study
- Encourage feedback
- Address questions


- Public participation
- Development Application for property Nos. 24-28 Myra Street and Nos. 25-27 Highlands Avenue
- Interim Heritage Order





Agenda

- Background
- Purpose of Study
- Overview of Council's heritage provisions
- Presentation by Godden Mackay Logan
- Close 8.00pm





Background

- September 2003 Council received a petition from local residents requesting a draft LEP be prepared to protect the heritage and streetscape qualities of Wahroonga (North)
- On 5 November 2003, Council resolved to undertake a heritage review





Background (cont.)

- Expressions of interest sought from consultants
- On 4 August 2004, Council appointed Godden Mackay Logan to undertake the review





Purpose of Study

- To undertake an assessment of the heritage and streetscape qualities of Wahroonga (North)
- If the area is determined to be of heritage significance, identify appropriate planning controls to retain and enhance the qualities of the area





Study Area



Bounded by Myra Street, Alexandria Parade, Edgeworth David Avenue and F3 Freeway.





Heritage Provisions

- Hornsby Shire Local Environmental Plan 1994
 - Sets provisions for heritage
 - Lists heritage items
 - Establishes heritage conservation areas





Heritage Items

Existing Heritage Items in the Study Area







Heritage Provisions (cont.)

- Heritage Development Control Plan
 - Provides guidance and controls for development relating to heritage items and heritage conservation areas.





Where to From Here?

- Progression of heritage assessment by Godden Mackay Logan
- Second Community Information Meeting (March 2005)
- Report recommendations to Council (April 2005)
- Formal exhibition

Appendix C

Summary Outcomes of the Community Consultation, 2 December 2004

Appendix C Community Consultation December 2004

A letter was sent by Hornsby Shire Council to residents of the proposed Wahroonga (North) Heritage Conservation Area advising of the Community Consultation and giving a brief outline of the planned agenda inviting attendance to a presentation by the consultants on 2 December 2004. The meeting was attended by approximately forty local residents.

Both Godden Mackay Logan and the Hornsby Shire Council presented PowerPoint presentations, which are included in this report as Appendices A and B.

Of main concern to the residents was what the result of a conservation area being declared might be on their property values, block size, development consents and the areas development, particularly in relation to SEPP 5 style development.

Residents were also interested to know how the character of such an area as Wahroonga (North) could be defined in regards to the diverse building styles. Another concern was on the preservation of trees within the proposed Heritage Conservation Area (HCA).

Godden Mackay Logan and the Council responded to each of these issues on the night.

Acknowledging that some additional information may be forthcoming from local long term residents or those unable to attend that night, a questionnaire and response form was supplied on the evening for further comment. Eight responses were forwarded to Hornsby Shire Council from local residents. The majority were in support of the proposed HCA, with some offering new information in regards the history and development of the area and one of the responses outlined an opposition to the proposed HCA.

The issues raised on the evening have been incorporated and addressed where possible into the draft report and a second community consultation is scheduled for 12 April 2005 to present its findings.

Godden Mackay Logan

Appendix D

Wahroonga (North) Heritage Conservation Area Assessment, December 2004—Comments and Feedback Form

Comments and Feedback

Wahroonga (North) Heritage Conservation Area Assessment, December 2004

Your Feedback and Comments are Welcome

Your Details (optional)

Name	
Postal Address	
Phone Number	
Email Address	

Godden Mackay Logan Contacts

Mark Dunn (Consultant) OR Sheridan Burke (Director)

Godden Mackay Logan Pty Ltd 78 George Street Redfern NSW 2016 Phone: 02 9319 4811 Fax: 02 9319 4383 Email: heritage@ gml.com.au Website: www.gml.com.au

Appendix E

Godden Mackay Logan PowerPoint Presentation for Community Consultation, 12 April 2005

Wahroonga (North) Heritage Conservation Area Assessment

Community Consultation Stage 2

12 April 2005

Meeting Purpose

- Background to heritage conservation area review
- Overview of history, character and significance of area
- Opportunities and threats to area
- Heritage Planning in Hornsby
- Study recommendations
- Feedback
- Close 8.00pm

Conservation Areas

- Conservation areas possess historic and usually also aesthetic values
- Conservation areas have particular heritage values that distinguish them from their surroundings
- Conservation areas are more than a collection of individual heritage items
- Conservation areas have historical origins and relationships between elements that create a sense of place that is worth keeping

Wahroonga (North) Heritage Conservation Area Assessment

Study Brief:

- Is it a conservation area?
- What is its significance?
- What is its character?
- How should it be conserved?

The Wahroonga (North) Heritage Conservation Area Assessment Study tasks include:

- Research the history of the area and analyse its themes of development
- Undertake detailed fieldwork to identify contributory elements, buildings and places and the significant characteristics of the area
- Formulate a statement of significance
- Consult with residents for input and feedback
- Recommend planning and management strategies



Historical Overview

Aboriginal Occupation

- Aboriginal settlement in the Hornsby area dating back 15–20,000 years
- Settlement areas extending from the plateau areas to the Hawkesbury River
- Contact between Aborigines and Europeans in the Hornsby area from as early as 1794
- By 1820s, the Aboriginal population has been severely dislocated, with the majority of the people having either left or been forced from the area

Historical Overview

Early European Settlement

- Convict and Government timber gangs are operating in the region from the c1820s
- Private timber merchants follow during the 1830s, notably Thomas Hyndes and Aaron Pearce
- Orchards followed as the timber resource was removed. Dominated the landscape from mid 1800s to 1880s



Heritage Consultants



1893 Map showing land holders

The Railway

- The railway for the North Shore was first proposed in 1875
- First surveys during 1879–1880 from Pearces Corner to the harbour
- 1883 the line was re-surveyed and work began in 1887
- The railway opened from Pearces Corner to St Leonards in January 1890, and onto Milsons Point in 1893

The Estates

- The railway allowed for and encouraged greater settlement of the Wahroonga area
- City elite began to purchase large estates close to the proposed line for the construction of grand houses
- Earliest example is The Highlands, built in 1892/3 for Alfred Hordern and his wife Caroline. Architect designed by John Horbury Hunt. The Highlands Estate covered almost half of the study area.
- Bundarra Estate dominates the remaining eastern portion of the study area. Bundarra homestead was removed for the Newcastle Freeway.
- Other large houses include Neringla (Woonona Avenue)



The Highlands, built 1892/3 Designed by John Horbury Hunt, the estate dominated the Wahroonga (North) area for 40 years

Subdivision

- The access provided by the railway put pressure on the estates to subdivide
- First sales advertised in early 1890s. Bundarra Estates' first subdivision in October 1892, but mainly focuses to the south of the railway line, between railway and Lane Cove Road (Pacific Highway)
- Subdivision continues in the study area until the 1950s



Bundarra Estate 1899

The Highlands Estate and later subdivision

- The Highlands Estate remained substantially intact until 1933.
 Part of the estate had been sold in 1923 for an Infants School and more in 1933 for the Primary School
- 1932 Alfred Horden died, in 1933 the first 18 lots were offered for sale fronting Myra Street, Edgeworth David Road, Bundarra Avenue and Alexandria Parade
- Later sales reduced the estate to its present size, while also creating the streets, Highlands Avenue, Fern Avenue and Oleander Road



Godden Mackay Logan

Heritage Consultants

1930 aerial photograph showing the study area


Godden Mackay Logan
Heritage Consultants

1938 Subdivision sale of part of The Highlands Estate



Water Board plan of Bundarra Ave and Ingalara Ave in 1937 (subdivided 1926)

Inter-war and postwar development

- The subdivision of The Highlands estate in the 1930s provided many new lots for development
- Many significant houses of the inter-war period are present in the study area, including California Bungalows and Moderne Style
- 1940s and 1950s some Housing Commission development in Lochville Street
- Also some architect designed 'project homes' on individual sites



Godden Mackay Logan

June 1950 sale of the Neringla Estate One of the last major estate sales in the Wahroonga area

Newcastle-Sydney Freeway

- First proposed in 1948 following the course of the Spring Creek Gully, boundary between Hornsby and Ku-ring-gai Shires
- Property acquisition begins in the 1970s
- Construction of road bridges at Edgeworth David Avenue and Alexandria Street, and Railway Bridge started early 1980s
- Freeway opened in 1989
- The construction created the eastern boundary of the study area, and resulted in the demolition of a number of properties as well as the dislocation of local cross streets eg Bareena Street and Lochville Avenue

Historic Themes

- Historic Themes provide a context within which heritage assessment criteria can be applied and help in evaluating comparative significance of an item or place
- Themes can be used as an alerting device to stimulate broad scale thinking about a place and its connections
- Thematic analysis is used to identify the relevant development and historical framework within which the significance of items and places can be assessed
- Thematic analysis provides a basis for undertaking fieldwork to test and query historic documentation

Potential Historic Themes for Wahroonga (North)

- Aboriginal culture and interactions: Aboriginal settlement, sites and contact
- Agriculture and forestry: the orchardists and timber getters
- Transport: the railway and its influence
- Towns, suburbs and villages: the subdivision pattern and streetscape
- Accommodation: house styles
- Domestic life: the gardens
- Education: the Waitara Primary School

Character

- The pattern of houses and blocks constitutes evidence of the gradually evolving subdivision pattern, extending from the estates of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, to the generous cottage subdivisions of the pre WW1 and interwar years, to the ever smaller blocks (with increasingly larger houses) of the later twentieth century which all together comprise the Area's development history until the present day.
- The predominant land use remains almost exclusively that of detached residences on single lots.
- There is a notable variation in lot sizes and shapes, derived of the early estate and street patterns, and the subdivision plans adopted.
- The Area still features generous garden settings, with private gardens to front and rear (sometimes also to the side), and widths generally sufficient to provide for landscaped setbacks, driveways to rear-sited garages, and high levels of privacy and amenity between dwellings — many gardens are listed as heritage items in their own right.



The Highlands, built 1892/3 Designed by John Horbury Hunt, the estate dominated the Wahroonga (North) area for 40 years



Substantial Moderne style houses

- Examples of substantial, largely intact and significant houses from the Late Victorian and Federation periods, encompassing the major architectural styles of those times with significant individual examples – the Late Victorian Aesthetic Movement mansion 'Highlands', by J Horbury Hunt; 'Neringla' and 'Cherrygarth', the noted Federation Queen Anne Revival mansions – along with some smaller homes of the same period, eg small timber cottages such as No. 2 Churchill Avenue.
- Examples of good, characteristic Inter-War period houses, in styles ranging across the Old English, Mediterranean and Californian Bungalow fashions (eg 58 Woonona Avenue, and 26–28 Myra Street) with some early 'Moderne' examples (eg No. 15 Ingalara Avenue) and a small group of Housing Commission style cottages in Lochville and Douglas Avenues.
- Examples of interesting, more modest mid and late-twentieth century houses, some of them on smaller lots created by comparative late subdivisions (eg 2A Highlands Avenue).
- There are also numbers of recently built houses of larger scale on comparatively smaller blocks with less landscaped setting, eg new houses in Highlands Avenue and the northern part of Woonona Avenue. Some of these are obtrusive in their context, due to their scale, bulk, and site cover.



A striking early Moderne style house at 15 Ingalara Avenue



Some small Edwardian period timber cottages survive, with remnant garden plantings



Inter-war Mediterranean homes with carefully managed gardens add to the complexity of the streetscapes



New homes often incorporate garages placed to the front of their house and with large unsympathetic doors and paved forecourts

Fieldwork 1

- A comparatively small number of Heritage Items in the Study Area.
- A large number of properties that are contributory to the Study Area.
- A significant number of non-contributory properties offer important opportunities for appropriate contextual re-development within the Area.
- The Area does not include any significant public open space. The only public buildings are those in the Waitara Public School, whose grounds form the largest open landscaped space within the Study Area.



The Waitara Public School complex is the only group of public buildings within the area



Godden Mackay Logan Heritage Consultants

A monument to an early pupil of the school, inscribed with later additional dedications



Fieldwork 2

- Significant mature street tree plantings (such as those in Myra Street, Bundarra Avenue and Churchill Avenue) contribute to the marked bushland character and tree-covered amenity of the Area as a whole. These are complemented by the high number of tall native forest trees which have been retained within private gardens and back yards.
- There is a wide variety of front fences, many of which are low, and usually combined with hedge and screen plantings. Many of the more carefully designed and original houses are complemented by appropriately composed front fences, which with the plantings used, do not divorce houses from the street.
- Dividing fences are mostly timber framed with palings or wire, and are screened by garden plantings.
- Surviving earlier garages are not set forward of the homes they serve, but are set mainly behind the building line, or behind the house, making them less noticeable in streetscapes.
- Driveways and paved areas are generally secondary, in terms of area, to the soft landscaping in the street and front gardens of the older homes, whereas new houses tend to have large paved driveway aprons.



The area retains a remarkable number of mature native trees, augmented by later street and private garden plantings



Low stone walls combine with established garden plantings to create strong streetscapes

Comparative Analysis

- Northern Ku-ring-gai National Trust listed conservation areas under review (generally earlier houses)
- Dominant family held estates such as:
 - Mt Wilga, Hornsby
 - Thring Estate, Wahroonga
 - Kooyong, Warrawee
- CPC Heritage Assessment Rosebank Avenue, Epping, 2003
- National Trust Interwar Heritage Survey

Analysis of Criteria Heritage Act 1977 (NSW)

'An item is important in the course, or pattern, of NSW's or the local area's cultural or natural history'

- The Wahroonga (North) area is important in the history of Hornsby Shire as a part of the areas consolidation as a residential area of high quality and amenity
- It reflects the evolution of the Shire from timbergetting, through merchants retreats and estates, to the bush suburb it still represents.

'An item has strong or special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in the cultural or natural history of NSW or of the local area'

- The character of Wahroonga (North) has been strongly influenced by the long endurance, but eventual subdivision, of the Hordern family estate, The Highlands.
- The area has had a number of notable residents from the arts and politics including the late Robert Klippel (sculptor) and Sir Howard Beale (Menzies Cabinet Minister and Ambassador to the USA).

'An item is important in demonstrating aesthetic characteristics and/or a high degree of creative or technical achievement in NSW or the local area'

• The Wahroonga (North) area is aesthetically distinctive due to the presence of a fine collection of residential dwellings of different periods (particularly between the 1930s and 1950s) and styles, but unified and complemented by their bushland setting.

'An item has strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group in NSW or the local area for social, cultural or spiritual reasons'

• Wahroonga (North) has a demonstrated importance to its community's sense of place expressed in the consultation undertaken by Council to discuss attitudes to the proposed implementation of the Conservation Area.

'An item has potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of NSW's or the local areas cultural or natural history'

• Wahroonga (North) retains an important capacity to reveal more about its significance through research and physical survey, contributing to the community's better understanding of its history.

'An item possesses uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of NSW's or the local area's cultural or natural history'

- Wahroonga (North) area demonstrates residential development exhibiting qualities that are rare with Hornsby and which are endangered by continuing unsympathetic development activity.
- In The Highlands and the fine housing of Ingalara Avenue, it has a property of exceptional interest and a streetscape of rare quality, amenity and integrity in the Hornsby LGA.

'An item is important in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of NSW's or of the local area's:

- cultural or natural places; or

- cultural or natural environments'

 In its collection of largely intact and harmonious housing, outstanding within Hornsby for their quality and integrity as a largely contemporary group, and complemented by their remarkable bushland suburban setting, the Area is of high local importance to Hornsby.

Statement of Significance

- The Wahroonga (North) Conservation Area is significant within Hornsby for its compact, representative demonstration of major themes and development periods in the history of the Shire. The distinctive qualities and retained integrity of its diverse subdivision pattern, streetscapes and houses, coalesced within its enduring bush suburban setting, support its recognition and management as a Conservation Area of Local Significance to Hornsby and the Upper North Shore.
- Precisely bounded by local and regional transport corridors, the Area still
 reflects its formative component subdivisions and retains a richly illustrative
 collection of housing periods and styles particularly between the 1930s and
 1950s. Notable amongst these are the Horbury Hunt designed, Hordern
 Family residence The Highlands, whose endurance as a large estate
 delayed closer subdivision and shaped the street pattern and housing mix of
 the Area. Significant numbers of Interwar and postwar Bungalows, such as
 the fine group in Ingelara Avenue, also figure in its distinctive character.

Heritage Planning: Hornsby Shire

To ensure that the specific heritage qualities and character of Hornsby Shire are maintained, Hornsby Council has:

- Included heritage provisions in the LEP (1994) which lists 800 items;
- Produced a Development Control Plan to guide and assist property owners;
- Established a Local Heritage Assistance Fund;
- Collected local history resources and reference material in the Local Studies library;
- Employed a heritage officer, in-house; and
- Undertaken an ongoing program of revision of heritage items and conservation areas (of which this is part).

Conservation Area Objectives

- Retain the heritage significance and significant characteristics of the HCA.
- Retain and conserve heritage items and contributory items (ie those identified as contributing to the significance of the HCA).
- Retain the significant landscaped characteristics of the HCA, including the garden setting of residences, enhanced by street planting and grass verges, and the tree canopy of exotic and indigenous vegetation that permeates the area.
- Encourage the reconstruction of heritage items and contributory items that have been unsympathetically altered.
- Allow removal/alteration of uncharacteristic features that detract from the significance of the HCA.
- Ensure that development is compatible with the heritage significance and significant characteristics of the HCA. Development shall respect the principles contained in the Burra Charter.

Opportunities

- Good heritage advice available through Council
- Financial support for heritage works via Council's heritage fund
- Community support for area

Threats

- Subdivision of larger allotments
- 'Seniors' development impacts
- Scale/design infill housing

Typical Development Considerations in a Conservation Area

- subdivision pattern
- form, bulk and scale of new development or alteration
- details and materials
- fences and garden walls
- garages, carports and outbuildings
- landscaping palette
- the public domain



A side porte-cochere and rear sited garage attached to a fine Californian bungalow


Side setbacks wide enough for driveways, combine with rear garages to maximise the apparent spaciousness of home settings



Unusual bushstone pitched frontage wall — a softer retaining structure





Large modern Federation revival style homes are an increasing presence in the areas' streetscapes

Recommendations of Study

- 1. Adopt Wahroonga (North) Heritage Conservation Area as a Conservation Area in the LEP.
- 2. Adopt NSW Heritage Council's Infill Guidelines.
- 3. Change the Heritage DCP.
- 4. Interpret the significance of the Heritage Conservation Area.
- 5. Manage the area in concert with other HCAs in the Shire, in full recognition of its significance.
- 6. No changes to its boundary are recommended.
- 7. The statement of significance should be included in the Heritage DCP.

Adopt NSW Heritage Council's Infill Guidelines

- The Heritage Council of NSW and the Royal Institute of Architects, New South Wales have recently redrafted guidelines for Infill Development as part of the New South Wales Government's promotion of high quality design of new buildings. The guidelines are designed to inform design within the context of the place it is set down for and to respond to that context. The guidelines have been set out in categories and explained as case studies, to make for easier implementation. The guidelines set out principles for character, scale, form, siting, materials and colour and detailing.
- It is recommended that Council adopt these guidelines in respect of all its Heritage Conservation Areas.

Changes to the Heritage DCP

- It is recommended that changes be made to the Hornsby Shire Heritage DCP as set out in Section 8.0 of report to apply to the Wahroonga (North) HCA.
- Study Report identifies Aims for the HCA:
 - What to keep
 - What to encourage
 - What to avoid
- Covers streetscape; existing buildings (alterations and additions); new buildings; infill development; garages, carports and outbuildings; details and materials; fences; gardens; and public domain.

Changes to the Heritage DCP (continued)

- Include the statement of significance
- Extend advice on new dwelling design
- Include advice on dual occupancy management
- Add specific garage/carport/outbuilding section
- Amplify streetscape/landscape sections with regards ancillary uses (pools, courts etc)

Interpret the significance of the Heritage Conservation Area

- Hornsby Shire Council has already implemented an interpretation strategy for other conservation areas within the Shire boundary. The nearby Wahroonga Heritage Conservation Area (centred around Isis Street) includes a plaque affixed to a boulder in the street, which gives a brief explanation of the history and heritage of the conservation area.
- Develop distinctive street signage in HCA.
- Develop oral history project in area with local residents.
- Develop study unit on area's development for HSIE and history students (Twentieth Century Unit).
- Consult with community.

Wahroonga (North) Heritage Conservation Area Assessment April 2005

Your Feedback and Comments are Welcome

Your Details (optional)	Godden Mackay Logan Contacts
Name Postal Address Phone Number Email Address	Mark Dunn (Consultant) or Sheridan Burke (Director) Godden Mackay Logan Pty Ltd 78 George Street Redfern NSW 2016
	Phone: 02 9319 4811 Fax: 02 9319 4383 Email: <u>heritage@gml.com.au</u> Website: www.gml.com.au

Appendix F

Summary Outcomes of the Community Consultation, 12 April 2005

Appendix F Community Consultation April 2005

On 12 April 2005 Godden Mackay Logan and Hornsby Shire Council conducted a second Community Consultation session for residents within the proposed Wahroonga (North) Heritage Conservation Area.

A letter was sent to residents informing them of the proposed HCA by Hornsby Shire Council. The meeting was attended by approximately forty residents, not all of whom had attended the first consultation in December. Godden Mackay Logan presented a PowerPoint presentation with the findings of their study, which is included in this report as Appendix E.

As with the December consultation, the main concerns of the residents was what the result of a conservation area being declared might be on their property values, block size, development consents and the areas development, with particular interest in Seniors Living style developments.

These issues were addressed by Godden Mackay Logan and the Council on the night.

A Comments and Feedback form was also provided for residents to fill in at a later time, or for those who could not attend the evening. Four responses were returned by local residents of which three were in support of the proposed HCA with one against.

Godden Mackay Logan